# Attachment No. 8

This attachment provides a matrix of revisions to the October 2021 Adopted Housing Element. Edits to the Housing Element are noted below in legislative format; text to be removed is shown in ~~strikethrough~~ and new text is underlined. The matrix includes changes reflected in 1) the City of Oxnard Conceptual Draft Amended 2021-2029 Housing Element that was release to the public of the on May 5, 2022 and submitted to HCD on May 12, 2022 (May 13, 2022 Letter to HCD); and 2) Revisions that were published on June 28, 2022 and sent to HCD on July 7, 2022 (June 28, 2022 letter to HCD), which were based on follow up input from HCD discussions with staff on June 22nd and 30th, 2022 and ongoing community input on the May 2022 Draft.

On July 11, 2022 HCD sent a conditional certification letter based on the May 2022 Draft and the proposed July 7, 2022 revisions.

The following revisions summarize changes to the City Council adopted Housing Element (October 2021). Changes can be categorized as substantial and non-substantial changes. Changes have been reviewed with housing advocates and interested parties. Most of the changes can be considered non-substantial.

| **Page Number** | **Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change** | **Updated Information or Input Received** | **Description of Change** | **Staff Comment** |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Page B-19 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); and June 22, 2022 and June 28, 2022 meetings with HCD (Attachment 6 June 28, 2022 Letter to HCD) - clarify the number of estimated housing units in need of rehabilitation.<br><br>Current Information: Update Code Compliance data through 2022 and | "The City relies on anecdotal information from inspector, Police and Fire department field personnel, and Code Compliance cases to provide statistics on the condition of the housing stock. <u>From 2015 through 2022, Code Compliance has opened a total of 518 substandard housing cases, investigated a total of 2,168 substandard Housing cases and resolved/closed 529 substandard housing cases.</u>"<br><br><u>"As summarized in Table B-25, approximately 45 percent of the housing units in the City were constructed prior to 1970 and may be in need of some type of rehabilitation or replacement. Although age does not always correlate with substandard housing conditions, neighborhoods with a concentration of homes 50 years old (or more) are more likely than newer neighborhoods to experience housing problems stemming from deferred maintenance, inadequate landscaping, and outdated utilities, and therefore approximately 11,440 units could be in need of rehabilitation. However, this does not consider ongoing property</u> | The code compliance information is being updated to include current data through March 2022.<br><br>HCD requested that the Housing Element further clarify the number of estimated housing units in need of rehabilitation or replacement.<br><br>The discussion on Program 1 (Code Compliance Program) has also been updated to include a targeted housing conditions survey as requested by HCD reviewer Melinda Coy in |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | owner reinvestment and most likely the rehabilitation need is much lower. To ensure the City has an accurate understanding of the neighborhoods in need of rehabilitation, the City has included in Program 1 a commitment to complete a windshield housing condition survey in targeted older and lower income neighborhoods which will help to inform the City on where rehabilitation efforts should be focused. " | discussions with the City's Housing Element consultant, Placeworks, in a phone call on June 28, 2022. |
| B-33 | Non-substantial change | Date May 31, 2022 meeting with Barbara Macri Ortiz (see Attachment 9 May 25, 2022 email) - Add to Section B.8 Fair Housing a discussion on the City's recently adopted Just Cause and Rent Stabilization ordinances. | The City adopted a Just Cause Eviction ordinance (Ord. No. 3012) and a Rent Stabilization ordinance (Ord. No. 3013) on May 3, 2022 that are more protective than California Civil Code Section 1946.2. These two ordinances became effective June 3, 2022 and were codified into the OCC under Chapter 27 Articles I and II. The Just Cause ordinance requires landlords to give tenants a reason for their eviction (Consistent with California AB 1482) and includes a requirement that the owner provide tenant relocation assistance for no-fault evictions equal to 2 months of the tenant's rent or $5,000, whichever is greater. The Rent Stabilization Ordinance restricts annual rent adjustments to not more than 4%. Both ordinances make it illegal for owners or their representatives to retaliate against tenants for lawfully and peaceably exercising their legal rights under the ordinances. The landlords are required to post notice of the existence of Chapter 27 in the following languages: English, Purepecha, Mixteco, Otomi, Tagalog, Zapoteco, Nahuatl, and Spanish. | This information is being added due to development and adoption of this program after Council approval of the October 2021 Housing Element.<br><br>Note: the effective date of the ordinances is incorrect in the legislative draft. This will be updated for the version that is submitted to HCD. |
| Pages B-35 & B-36 | Non-substantial change | As a result of ongoing public outreach, staff identified a need for a clear | "The different categories of areas in terms of resources as defined by TCAC are shown below. Not all of the types of areas currently exist in Oxnard. The current map and types of areas | The definitions for Opportunity Areas (aka resource categories) from |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | description of the different resource categories as defined by TCAC in Housing Element Section B.8 Fair Housing Assessment. | identified represent a static moment in time and will change over time.<br><br>**High Segregation & Poverty.** Areas in which at least 30 percent of the population earns an income below the federal poverty line and there is an overrepresentation of people of color relative to the county.<br><br>**High Resource.** Top 40 percent highest-scoring census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts have access to highly positive outcomes in terms of health, economic attainment, and education attainment.<br><br>**Highest Resource.** Top 20 percent highest-scoring census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts have access to the best outcomes in terms of health, economic attainment, and education attainment.<br><br>**Low Resource.** Bottom 30 percent of remaining census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts could be experiencing a lack of access to positive environmental, economic, and education factors results in negative outcomes or perpetuated outcomes (such as perpetuated poverty).<br><br>**Moderate Resource.** Top 30 percent of remaining census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts have access to either somewhat positive outcomes in terms of health, economic attainment, and education; or positive outcomes in a certain area (e.g., score high for health, education) but not all areas (e.g., may score poorly for economic attainment).<br><br>**Moderate Resource (Rapidly Changing).** A filter applied to moderate resource tracts based on index scores | the California Tax Credit Allocation Committee (TCAC) have been added to the Housing Element for clarity. Note that Oxnard does not have any areas that qualify as high or highest resource areas (See Housing Element Figure B-2 TCAC/HCD Opportunity Areas). |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | just below the high resource threshold and experiencing rapid increases in key dimensions of opportunity (housing price, median income, job proximity, etc.). " | |
| Page B-36 | Non-substantial change | Add reference to new Figure B-12, R/ECAP map | "Oxnard has three census tracts that are considered a Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Area of Poverty (R/ECAP), or areas in which more than 50 percent of the population identifies as non-white and there is a poverty rate of 40 percent or more or a poverty rate of more than three times the average poverty rate for the county (see Figure B-12)." | See discussion for Page B-58. |
| Page B-39 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); update to address AFFH. | "To address issues of segregation and poverty the City has included Programs 2, 4, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 19, and 26, 29, 33 & 34 in Chapter G to:"<br>● "Increasing housing mobility opportunities and/or housing in high resource areas." | This revision adds programs where AFFH goals are addressed. An AFFH goal to increase mobility to high resource areas has been added to the list of how the Housing Element addresses patterns of segregation. |
| Page B-40 to B-42 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). HCD recommended that the Housing Element include additional factors/policies/ programs related to access to transportation opportunities; | "In February 2011, the City adopted a Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities Master Plan, which identified the existing bike and pedestrian infrastructure and the demand for routes, improvements, and/or safety features. As identified in the Plan, the City has existing Class II bike routes (separate bike lane) citywide, including within the City's low resource areas in central Oxnard and areas designated as an R/ECAP. Within the R/ECAPs, Class II bike routes are provided along Gonzales Road, Camino Del Sol, and Rose Avenue providing either direct or proximate access to seven schools and several parks. The Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities Master | The discussion on Mobility Options in Chapter B is being updated to include a discussion on the City's adopted Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities Master Plan, which will be incorporated with the City's Sustainable Transportation Plan (STP). The Plan includes |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | specifically, land use controls for bike lanes, carsharing, walkability and pedestrian infrastructure to expand access to public transportation.. | Plan includes proposed bike plan improvements and expansions, most significantly a multi-use path (not in the roadway) for bikes and pedestrians that runs north and south in central Oxnard along Oxnard Boulevard and connecting path (east/west) within the R/ECAP along Fifth Street. This will provide convenient and safe access to a major commercial corridor and is accessible to residents of low resource and R/ECAP areas. The Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities Master Plan will be reviewed and incorporated as a part of the City's Sustainable Transportation Plan (STP) effort, which was initiated in 2022. Access, multi-modal transportation, and environmental amenities are significant goals of the Sustainable Transportation Plan. The City has added an action item to Program 19 in Chapter G regarding the completion of the City of Oxnard STP in Fiscal Year 2022-2023. The STP will address disparities in access to transportation opportunities by incorporating complete streets design, safe routes to school, vision zero, sidewalk and bike lane improvements and first/last mile planning in tandem with land use opportunities in lower resourced areas including R/ECAPs and areas of linguistic isolation. Following submission of the housing element to HCD in October 2021, the City received a $410,000 transportation grant from Caltrans toward completing the STP. In April 2022 the City Council awarded a professional services agreement with Fehr & Peers to develop the STP. Development of the STP will include idea generation and prioritization, establishment of the sustainable transportation framework, catalog of enhanced streetscape elements, conceptual design alternatives, identification of funding sources, | Class II bike routes (separate bike lanes) within the City's low resource areas in central Oxnard and areas designated as R/ECAP to provide mobility options for residents. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | implementation steps, and a final STP for adoption by the City Council.<br><br>A key initiative of the City's Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities Master Plan was to complete a citywide sidewalk survey to identify areas of increased pedestrian demand (based on proximity to schools, commercial areas/employment centers, and public transit, among other factors) and barriers to safely utilize pedestrian infrastructure in areas of high demand. The City completed the report of High Demand Pedestrian Areas in 2015, identifying 14 high demand pedestrian areas that each encompass about one to two blocks. Of the 14 pedestrian areas, 11 are located along Oxnard Boulevard/South Oxnard Boulevard/ Saviers Road corridor, and seven (or half) are concentrated along South Oxnard Boulevard between West Ninth Street to the south and Palm Drive to the north (referred to as Downtown Oxnard in the report). These areas fall within census tracts designated as low resource (west of South Oxnard Boulevard) and an area of High Segregation and Poverty (east of South Oxnard Boulevard) and would reasonably be utilized by residents in both census tracts. The High Demand Pedestrian Areas report identified that within a half mile radius of these areas there were approximately 20 instances of missing curb ramps and 40 instances of pedestrian collisions. Compared to the City's other high demand pedestrian areas, Downtown Oxnard has lower instances of missing curbs and ramps, which is more significant since it is the largest area surveyed. With the exception of Palm Drive, the high demand pedestrian areas in Downtown Oxnard also received relatively low scores comparatively for ADA Severity, an indicator for the number of barriers within each area for a person with | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | disabilities to safely navigate as a pedestrian. However, the number of pedestrian collisions in Downtown Oxnard is higher than other areas of high pedestrian demand. The report includes the following suggested programs for the City to consider that would address pedestrian safety.<br><br>● Consider adopting a Vision Zero policy sets the goal of reducing traffic-related fatalities to zero by a certain year. The City would work to improve safety conditions for all road users, particularly vulnerable users like pedestrians and cyclists.<br>● Consider adopting a Complete Streets policy to institutionalize practices associated with complete streets.<br>● Install pedestrian-friendly traffic signals, such as leading pedestrian intervals that gives pedestrians an advance walk signal before motorists get a green signal, and pedestrian-oriented speed limits.<br><br>These efforts have been included in Program 19.<br><br>In addition to providing infrastructure for alternative transportation, the City further supports alternative forms of transportation in the Downtown by allowing centralized parking in an offsite lot for residential developments rather than requiring parking minimums onsite. This allows more efficient land use development by dedicating more space onsite to the land use, and in the case of multifamily housing, allows more units onsite. The City is committed to reviewing development standards and regulations on an annual basis to facilitate transit-oriented development Downtown (Program 19) and reviewing parking requirements citywide (Program 27). | |

<table>
<tr><th>Page Number</th><th>Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change</th><th>Updated Information or Input Received</th><th>Description of Change</th><th>Staff Comment</th></tr>
<tr><td>Pag B-58</td><td>Non-substantial change</td><td>Date May 31, 2022 meeting with Barbara Macri Ortiz (see Attachment 9, May 25, 2022 email) - Add R/ECAPS map as Figure B-12</td><td><u>Figure B-12 Racially or Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty (R/ECAPS)</u></td><td>Map is being added to assist affordable housing developers in locating R/ECAPS areas.</td></tr>
<tr><td>Pages D-2 & D-3</td><td>Non-substantial change</td><td>Current Information: Update data through February 28, 2022.</td><td>“Housing Completed Through ~~July 2021~~ <u>February 28, 2022</u><br><br>Housing Element law and HCD Guidelines allow cities to count housing units receiving entitlements, building permits, or certificate of occupation towards meeting the RHNA allocation if the entitlements, building permits, or certificate of occupation are issued after June 30, 2021. Table D-2 lists housing projects as of ~~July 2021~~ <u>February 2022</u> that have received building permits after June 30, 2021 and are expected to be fully developed by October 15, 2029.”<br><br>Table D-2. Residential Units Approved, through ~~July 2021~~ February 28, 2022
<table>
<tr><th>Project Name</th><th>Extremely Low/Very Low (EL/V</th><th>Low (Low)</th><th>Moder (Mod)</th><th>Above Moderate</th><th>Total</th></tr>
</table></td><td>This revision updates Tables D-2 & D-3 with building permits issued through February 28, 2022.</td></tr>
</table>

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | | | | | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | **L)** | | | | | |
| | | | ~~Duplex~~ Single Family, Detached, July – December 2021 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| | | | Duplexes July – Decembe 2021 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 4 |
| | | | F Street Condom ms, July - Decembe 2021 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 12 | 12 |
| | | | Wagon Wheel, Oxford F Single Family Attached July – Decembe 2021 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 24 | 24 |
| | | | Anacapa Townhor Single Family Attached July – Decembe 2021 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 16 | 16 |
| | | | Accessor dwelling units, Jul Decembe 2021 | 4 ~~1~~ | 6 ~~0~~ | 15 ~~0~~ | 0 | 25 ~~1~~ |
| | | | Accessor dwelling units, January - February 2022 | 3 ~~1~~ | 7 ~~0~~ | 2 ~~0~~ | 0 | 12 ~~1~~ |
| | | | ~~Accessor dwelling~~ | ~~0~~ | ~~1~~ | ~~0~~ | ~~0~~ | ~~1~~ |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| ~~unit~~ | | | | | |
| ~~Accessor dwelling unit~~ Wag Wheel, Oxford F Single Family Attached January - February 2022 | 0 | 0 ~~1~~ | 0 | 12 ~~0~~ | 12 ~~1~~ |
| ~~Accessor dwelling unit~~ | ~~0~~ | ~~1~~ | ~~0~~ | ~~0~~ | ~~1~~ |
| **TOTAL ~~(J 2021)~~** | **7 ~~2~~** | **13 ~~3~~** | **17 ~~0~~** | **70 ~~2~~** | **107 ~~7~~** |

*Source: City of Oxnard ~~July 2021~~ February 2022 project list*

*Note 1: The accessory dwelling units are counted as affordable to very low and low income households based on the survey of ADUs for rent conducted by the City in 2020-2022.*

Table D-3 presents the City's total and remaining RHNA for the 2021–2029 RHNA cycle after subtracting units that have been approved (Table D-2). As of ~~July 2021~~ February 2022, the City's total remaining RHNA need is 8,442 units in the four income categories.

**Table D-3. Remaining RHNA ~~through~~ as of ~~July 2021~~ February 28, 2022**

| Status Toward Goal | Extremely Low/Very Low | Low | Mod | Above Moderate | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| RHNA Allocati n (2014 | 1,840 | 1,071 | 1,538 | 4,100 | 8,549 |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | –2021)<br>Under Construction or Approved: 7 ~~2~~ / 13 ~~3~~ / 17~~0~~ / 70~~2~~ / 107~~8~~<br>Remaining: 1,833~~8~~ / 1,05~~68~~ / 1,521~~3~~ / 4,030~~9~~ / 8,45~~42~~<br>*Source: SCAG 2021; City of Oxnard 2022~~1~~* | |
| Page E-2 & E-3 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). HCD requested that the City add a definition of family. | **"Family**. A group of residents whose members jointly occupy a dwelling unit as a single housekeeping unit; have joint use of and responsibility for common areas; share household activities such as meals, chores, maintenance and expenses; but not including residents of commercial group living such as hotels, dormitories and fraternities."<br><br>**"Gross acreage**. The total area of a development site expressed in acres, usually including the area to be devoted to streets.<br><br>**High Segregation & Poverty.** Areas in which at least 30 percent of the population earns an income below the federal poverty line and there is an overrepresentation of people of color relative to the county.<br><br>**High Resource.** Top 40 percent highest-scoring census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts have access to highly positive outcomes in terms of health, economic attainment, and education attainment.<br><br>**Highest Resource.** Top 20 percent highest-scoring census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts have access to the best | The definition for 'family' in OCC Section 16-10 is the same as the building code definition for a household, which is a group of residents. This definition has been added to the Terms in Housing Element.<br><br>For clarity and a consistent understanding of terms, TCAC definitions for resource areas have been added to the definitions. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | outcomes in terms of health, economic attainment, and education attainment.<br><br>**Lot coverage**. The amount of a lot that is allowed to be covered by the footprint of structures on that lot.<br><br>**Low Resource.** Bottom 30 percent of remaining census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts could be experiencing a lack of access to positive environmental, economic, and education factors results in negative outcomes or perpetuated outcomes (such as perpetuated poverty).<br><br>**Moderate Resource.** Top 30 percent of remaining census tracts in the region. Indicates residents in these census tracts have access to either somewhat positive outcomes in terms of health, economic attainment, and education; or positive outcomes in a certain area (e.g., score high for health, education) but not all areas (e.g., may score poorly for economic attainment).<br><br>**Moderate Resource (Rapidly Changing).** A filter applied to moderate resource tracts based on index scores just below the high resource threshold and experiencing rapid increases in key dimensions of opportunity (housing price, median income, job proximity, etc.)." | |
| Page E-3 | Non-substantial change | Current Information: -AHP and -AHD zones adopted by Council in October 2021 | "In October 2021 the City adopted Affordable Housing Additive Zones (-AHP and -AHD). The Additive Zones are a residential overlay zones that allow multifamily development on nonresidential zoned sites identified in Supplement 1 of the Housing Element at densities of up to 30 du/ac with the provision of 20% of units affordable to lower income households. The Additive Zones have a specific set of objective standards to streamline the approval | A discussion on the Additive Zones that were adopted in October 2021 has been added to Housing Element Section E.1 Land-use Planning and Development Standards. |

<table>
<tr><th>Page Number</th><th>Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change</th><th>Updated Information or Input Received</th><th>Description of Change</th><th>Staff Comment</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>process for affordable projects and accommodate greater density, such as a higher height limit than the underlying zone. “</td><td>Note: the text in the legislative draft includes a typo (‘adopting’). This will be updated for the version that is submitted to HCD.</td></tr>
<tr><td>Page E-4, E- & E-14</td><td>Non-substantial change</td><td>Current Information: Newly adopted -AHP and -AHD zones added to Tables E-1 & E-2</td><td>Table E-1 Residential Zoning and 2030 General Plan Compatibility
<table>
<tr><th>Zoning District</th><th>Minimu Lot Area per housing unit (Square Feet)</th><th>Densit Range Units p Net Ac (Zoning</th><th>2030 Genera Plan La Use Designa on</th><th>Dwellir Units p Gross Acre (2030 Genera Plan)</th></tr>
<tr><td>-AHP/ -AHD</td><td>Affoda e Housin Additiv Zone</td><td>na</td><td>Up to 30</td><td>Affoda e Housi Additiv Zone</td><td>Up to 30</td></tr>
</table>
Table E-2 Residential Development Standards by Zoning District
<table>
<tr><th>Zonir Distr</th><th>Type Hous Allov</th><th>Dens Units Acre</th><th>Front</th><th>Side</th><th>Rear</th><th>Heigl</th><th>Min. Lot Size (Cove /FAR</th></tr>
<tr><td>-AHP -AHD</td><td>Multi ly resid al wi min of un affor e to lowe incor ADU Uses allow in</td><td>30 units per acre</td><td>20 f C 30 f BF</td><td>5 ft 1-2 s 7.5 f 3 st 10 f 4+ s in 30 str side BF</td><td>5 ft 1-2 s 7.5 f 3 st 10 f 4+ s in N/A BF</td><td>56</td><td>Und erlyir Zone</td><td>n/a</td></tr>
</table></td><td>Additive Zones that were adopted in October 2021 have been added to Tables E-1, E-2 and E-3 to show development standards specific to the new additive zones.</td></tr>
</table>

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | unde g zon<br><br>**Table E-3 Allowance for Housing in Oxnard's Nonresidential Zoning Districts**<br><br>**Zoni Distr / Type Hous Allov / Dens Units Acre / Front / Side / Rear / Heig / Min. Lot Size (Cove /FAR**<br><br>-AHP -AHD / Mult ly resid al wi min of un affor e to lowe incor ADUs Uses allow in unde g zon / 30 units per acre / 20 f C 30 f BF / 5 ft 1-2 s 7.5 f 3 st 10 f 4+ s in / 5 ft 1-2 s 7.5 f 3 st 10 f 4+ s in / 30 str side BF / N/ BF / 56 / Und erlyin Zone / n/a | |
| Page E-13 | Non-substantial change | Current Information: Newly adopted -AHP and -AHD zones added to discussion on Nonresidential Zoning Options. | The majority of housing opportunities in Oxnard are governed by its residential zoning districts. There is considerable opportunity for residential growth in ~~both~~ the commercial and industrial zoning districts and in the Downtown Zones: Downtown Core (DT-C), Downtown General (DT-G), and Downtown Edge (DT-E). Table E-3 summarizes these opportunities by nonresidential zoning district. Oxnard will need to take into consideration the requirements of California's Housing Accountability Act (California Government Code Section 65589.5) when considering applications for the districts listed in Table E-3. Lot coverage is indicated for each district in Table E-3. | Additive Zones that were adopted in October 2021 have been added discussion on Nonresidential Zoning Options. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | Many districts don't have a maximum lot coverage or FAR. Those that do have maximum lot coverage or FAR have large enough lot coverages to allow for maximum residential densities in that zone. In addition, in October 2021 multiple properties in zones in Table E-3 had an Affordable Housing overlay zone applied that allows 30 du/ac and objective development standards for affordable housing ~~are proposed to receive an overlay that allows high density housing and will be accompanied by any needed changes to development standards to facilitate those densities (See Programs 3, 30, 31, and 35 in Chapter G)~~. | |
| E-16 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). Provide additional discussion on if parking requirements for covered/ enclosed residential parking may create a constraint on affordability. | "Multifamily projects receive further parking reductions (no visitor spaces required) with a state density bonus, which is applicable to most multifamily development as they are subject to the City's inclusionary housing requirement of providing 10 percent lower income units. " | This revision adds a discussion on Multifamily parking requirements. Most multifamily project in the City have been subject to reduced state density bonus parking requirements due to the City's 10% lower income inclusionary housing ordinance that makes most multifamily development eligible for state density bonus. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| E-17 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). Provide additional discussion on if parking requirements for covered/ enclosed residential parking may create a constraint on affordability. | **Table E-4. Residential Off-Street Parking**<br><br>Requirements Detached single-family dwelling with Accessory Dwelling Unit<br><br>"Per OCC 16-468, ADU parking is not required for the majority of locations in the City. The City will update ADU code (16-468(D) and 16-622) to recognize current State law that no replacement parking spaces are required if using the garage for an ADU." | Minimum off-street parking requirement for Detached Single-family dwelling with Accessory Dwelling Unit In Table E-4 has been updated to include OCC 16-468. The OCC will need to be updated regarding ADU replacement parking to be consistent with State law. The code update will be processed at the same time as OCC updates listed in Program 6. |
| Page E-18 & E-19 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). Provide additional discussion on if parking requirements for covered/ enclosed residential parking may create a constraint on affordability. | "Only two (garage) spaces are presently required for single-family units up to five bedrooms, which are the majority of single-family units. Detached housing in Oxnard requires a minimum of two garage parking spaces for dwelling units up to six bedrooms,One additional garage space is required at seven bedrooms, and another space for eight or more bedrooms. In the case of apartments, only a single space is required, unless there are two or more bedrooms in the unit, in which case two are required. Only one visitor space is required for the first 30 units in a multifamily project. When the inclusionary regulations apply, as is the case on nearly all multifamily projects, visitor parking is waived altogether upon request of the developer. Adequate and appropriate on-site garage parking is a necessity that | Clarification on existing code requirements has been added to the Housing Element discussion on Parking Requirements.<br><br>Note: a clarifier "upon request of the developer" has been added to the revision that discusses visitor parking. This will be updated for the version that is submitted to HCD. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | prevents impacts on public streets and neighborhoods and provides secure parking for vehicles."<br><br>"The City has an administrative relief procedure that is often approved to request reduced parking under certain circumstances (such as retirement housing, senior housing, and affordable housing) and the City's density bonus ordinance is in compliance with state law to allow a lower parking requirement for projects that qualify for the density bonus. Most m~~M~~ultifamily projects in the City ~~are generally~~ are automatically eligible for parking reductions (no visitor parking) under State Density Bonus law as they are subject to the City's inclusionary housing requirement of providing 10 percent lower income units ~~reducing guest parking, utilizing tandem parking, and using more surface parking as the projects qualify for density bonus parking standards. The City~~OCC Section 16-466 also allows reduced parking requirements for senior and ~~affordable housing projects~~ senior assisted living residential facilities with approval of a parking study that demonstrates sufficient parking as well as shared parking when uses with different peaking characteristics (such as offices and apartments) are combined in a single structure. Program 27 also proposes to update the parking requirements in OCC Section 16-622 to move parking requirements for the elderly – residential care facilities, independent living, memory care – under residential uses (OCC 16-622 currently lists parking for assisted living and nursing homes under health services). Currently, assisted living requires one space for every two units plus one shuttle van parking space. Nursing Homes require one space per three beds for nursing and convalescent | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | homes which do not contain separate living quarters containing individual kitchens, plus one space for every two employees required on largest shift. Over the past five years, the City monitored the impacts of these parking studies for any constraints on the development of housing affordable to lower-income households. In addition, the new Downtown Code, approved in 2019, has reduced parking requirements for residential uses in the downtown and reductions for studio and one-bedroom apartments, as a result of a review of city parking requirements. The reduced requirements for the Downtown include The Downtown Parking In-Lieu fee program which facilitates designation of parking spaces to serve residential projects in Downtown in city parking garages rather than requiring parking onsite for each project." | |
| Page E-24 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). update to address HCD's comments on Reasonable Accommodation. | **Zoning and Land-Use Policies**<br>The Oxnard Zoning Code is conscious of fair housing law and the housing needs of the disabled. It contains provisions designed to accommodate the development of housing for residents with physical and/or mental challenges. Program 6 in Chapter G proposes to remove a finding that is part of the City's Reasonable Accommodation approval process for consistency with state law. | The Reasonable Accommodation findings in OCC Section 16-501.5 will be revised to remove a subjective consideration, in compliance with the Fair Housing Act. This OCC update will be processed at the same time as other code updates listed in Program 6. |
| Page E-26 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). Update discussion on | **Permit Procedure**<br>In compliance with the California Health and Safety Code, the City of Oxnard permits residential care facilities for the elderly by right. No Special Use Permit is required for these types of licensed | A discussion has been added on revision to the requirements for residential care to comply with |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | residential care facilities in relation to reason accommodation. | facilities in residential zones and the C-R zone as long as they are designed to serve no more than six persons, and residential care facilities with no more than 15 persons are permitted in the C-2 zone ~~by right~~. Similarly, congregate living health facilities are ~~allowed~~ permitted in residential zones, the C-R zone and the C-2 zone ~~by right~~, which ensures that the City provides the ability to consider these smaller types of dwellings for the elderly and disabled in its Municipal Code. To affirmatively promote more inclusive communities, the City will also review and revise the City's requirements for Residential Care Facilities with seven or more persons by the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023 and permit them as a residential use in zones where multifamily housing are permitted, subject only to those restrictions that apply to other residential dwellings of the same type in the same zone. | Reasonable Accommodation and AFFH.<br><br>Program 6 includes a new action item to review and revise the City's requirements for Residential Care Facilities to be permitted where multifamily housing are permitted and subject only to those restrictions that apply to other residential dwellings of the same type in the same zone. |
| Pages E-27 & E-28 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). Update to address HCD's comments on Reasonable Accommodation. | "Program 6 in Chapter G proposes to remove the following finding that is part of the City's Reasonable Accommodation approval process for consistency with state law:<br><br>§ Whether the accommodation would result in a substantial increase in traffic or insufficient parking.<br><br>Program 27 also proposes to move the requirements for parking for the elderly from the Health Services category to the Residential category, and expand the types of residential care facilities to recognize changes in the industry (currently only assisted living and nursing home are listed to encompass the various types of facilities, including residential care facilities, independent living, memory care, etc." | The Reasonable Accommodation approval process in OCC Section 16-501 will be revised in compliance with the Fair Housing Act.<br><br>Program 27 has been updated to list a revision to OCC Section 16-622 (Off-street Parking) to move the requirements for parking for the elderly from the Health Services category to the Residential category. This OCC update will |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | be processed at the same time as other code updates listed in Program 6. |
| Pages E-30 & E-31 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). Add to the the standards for emergency shelters and zoning code update in Program 6 to bring standards into compliance with state law. | The parking requirements stated above are in compliance with current state law. <u>The standards for emergency shelters listed below are out of compliance with state law. Under Program 6 in Chapter G the City will delete or revise these requirements to comply with state law:</u><br>● <u>The emergency shelter operator shall conduct a background check on all prospective patrons using Megan's Law database and restrict patron intake in accordance with State and local registered sex offender residency restrictions.</u><br>● <u>Patrons shall not possess or consume alcoholic beverages or illegal drugs while in the shelter, nor shall they possess weapons of any kind while in the shelter.</u><br>● <u>Space shall be allocated for each patron consisting of a bed and storage area.</u><br>● <u>At least two toilets, one shower and one sink shall be provided for every twenty patrons.</u><br>● <u>All items stored outdoors shall be screened from the view of all public rights-of-way.</u><br>● <u>Should an emergency shelter be proposed within 300 feet of a school, the development services director or designee may request that the developer/sponsor coordinate with the school district to address potential concerns.</u> | Existing OCC findings for emergency shelter have been provided per HCD's request. The standards are required to be updated to comply with state law. The revision will allow development standards specific to the underlying zone and those standards listed in Government Code Section 65583(a)(4)(A). This revision is discussed in Housing element Section F.4 under Other Special Needs Housing. |
| Page E-37 | Non-substantial change | Current Information: Newly adopted -AHP and -AHD | **Table E-7 Housing Types Permitted by Zoning District**<br>(See Table) | Additive Zones that were adopted in October 2021 have been added to Table E-7 to |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | zones added to Table E-7 | *Notes: 12. Permissible if allowed in underlying zone and subject to permitting required in underlying zone (see OCC 16-420c)* | clarify required permits (SPR or SUP) for multifamily in each overlay zone. Most residential uses listed as permissible if allowed in underlying zone. |
| Pages E-40 and E-41 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). List all findings for SUPs and add clarification regarding OCC 16-530 Purpose. | Once City staff have reviewed the application for the Special Use Permit as described above, it is forwarded to the Planning Commission for a public hearing. Developers are required to notify and then present their projects to the Planning Commission and public at that hearing so that interested citizens may provide input. This process is intended to confirm the public's issues and any concerns early in the development review process. The required findings for Special Use Permits are:<br><br>● The proposed use is in conformance with the General Plan and other adopted standards.<br>● The nature, condition and development of adjacent uses, buildings and structures shall be considered, and no proposed special use permit shall be granted if the approval body finds such use will adversely affect or be materially detrimental to such adjacent uses, buildings or structures or to the public health, safety or general welfare.<br>● The site that is subject to the special use permit shall be adequate in size and shape to accommodate the yards, walls, fences, parking and loading facilities, landscaping and items which may be required by section 16-532.<br>● The site that is subject to the special use permit shall be served by highways adequate in width and | The SUP findings were included in the October 2021 Housing Element. HCD's January 10th letter indicated that a third party identified a subjective finding for SUP approval that was not included in the City's list of SUP approval findings in Section E.5 Processing and Permit Procedures. The third party's referenced line was from the introductory section of the Division for SUP (OCC Section 16-530) that explains why SUPs are necessary in general and is not a required finding. This clarification has been added.<br><br>Note: the text in the legislative |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | improved as necessary to carry the kind and quantity of traffic such use would generate.<br>● The site that is subject to the special use permit shall be provided with adequate sewerage, water, fire protection and storm drainage facilities.<br><br>It should be noted that the above findings are the only criteria used to make a determination about approval of a project. The purpose section for Special Use Permits (OCC Section 16-530) includes the following language: "..necessary to preserve the integrity and character of the zoning district, the utility and value of adjacent property and the general welfare of the neighborhood and the public." This language is not a constraint to approval of Special Use Permits as it is not a required finding for approval. The Planning Commission must render a decision by written resolution, reciting any findings on which the decision is based and any conditions imposed on the approved permit, within 30 days of the public hearing. The conditions imposed upon a Special Use Permit may involve any of the factors affecting the establishment, operation, or maintenance of the requested use, including but not limited to: special yards, open spaces and buffer areas; fences and walls; traffic circulation and parking facilities; street and alley dedications and improvements; water supply, fire protection, sewerage service and storm drainage facilities; landscaping and maintenance of grounds; regulation of nuisance factors such as noise, vibrations, smoke, dust, dirt, odors, gasses, noxious matter, heat, glare, electromagnetic disturbances and radiation; regulation of operating hours for activities affecting normal neighborhood schedules and functions; | draft includes a misspelling. This will be updated for the version that is submitted to HCD. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | regulation of signs and outdoor advertising; a specified period limiting the time in which development may begin; provision for a bond or other surety that the proposed special use will be removed on or before a special date; height limitations to protect the character and integrity of abutting parcels or the general welfare; residential density, by specifying the number of dwelling units per acre; and such other conditions as will make possible the development of the proposed special use in an orderly and efficient manner and in general accordance with the intent of the Zoning Code.<br><br>The applicant may file an appeal of the Planning Commission's ruling to the City Council within 18 days after the date of the decision. | |
| Page E-41 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). HCD requested discussion on potential constraints on housing development caused by the design review process related to by-right development. | **Development Review Process**<br>Larger and more complex projects, such as subdivisions, condominiums, apartments, or projects that require other planning permits (e.g., Special Use Permits) usually require design review. However, in October 2021 the City Council approved a new ministerial Site Plan Review process for by-right approval of development on sites identified in Supplement 1 that were in prior Housing Elements. These sites are no longer subject to design review. Further discussion on Site Plan Review is provided in the next section. | Clarification was added that by-right development on sites identified in Supplement 1 are no longer subject to design review and references the new Site Plan Review process adopted by Council in October 2021. |
| Page E-42 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). HCD requested information on typical time between | Typical turn around time after receiving planning entitlements until requesting a building permit is driven by market and funding availability. Development projects are conditioned to secure a building permit within 12-36 months from entitlement (depending on the permit type). The last five residential projects that have been processed in | Information has been added on page E-42 to indicate the time between when an application receives their entitlement and when they apply |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | entitlement and building permit issuance. | the City took an average of 18 months between entitlement and the request for a building permit. | for building permits, which is typically dictated by the developers funding and outside of the City's control. |
| E-43 & E-44 | Non-substantial change | Date June 22, 2022 meeting with HCD (Attachment 6 June 28, 2022 Letter to HCD); add discussion on the newly adopted Site Plan Review permit process and findings. | With regard to parcels with the ~~proposed~~AHP additive zone, ~~the~~ a development that provides 20% lower income units would be reviewed under Site Plan Review rather than Design Review. The Site Plan Review process is discussed further below. ~~review process is staff approved and does not require review by the Planning Commission or City Council.~~<br><br>These concepts reviewed identify only technical issues such as architectural and landscape design issues and do not constrain development of housing affordable to lower-income households. Rather, they ensure functionality, public safety, and neighborhood compatibility.<br><br>**Site Plan Review Process**<br><br>In October 2021 the City Council approved a new ministerial Site Plan Review process (OCC 16-523) for reviewing by-right development, the addition of a new Affordable Housing Additive Zone code (16-420), and update to the Zoning map and General Plan Land Use Plan to include the new Affordable Housing Additive Zone. The Additive Zone code includes objective standards for reviewing affordable developments. Sites that are zoned AHP are reviewed under a Site Plan Review. Site Plan Review is reviewed by the Community Development Director unless the development is processed concurrently with a required discretionary permit. Procedures for Site Plan Review are outlined under OCC 16-523.2, and are intentionally | This revision provides a description of the City's new ministerial Site Plan Review process (OCC Section 16-523) that the City Council adopted as part of the 2021-2029 Final Housing Element in October 2021 for reviewing by-right development.<br><br>Reference to the Development standards for the Affordable Housing Additive Zone sites (OCC Section 16-420; also adopted in October 2021) have also been added to the discussion. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | streamlined to reduce costs and process time for affordable housing development. The process includes the following:<br><br>● The application is reviewed by the Development Advisory Committee (DAC) for consistency with applicable regulations and standards. The intent of this review is to provide interdepartmental perspective and coordination prior to project approval with the goal of streamlining the building permit process. This review is non-discretionary, though the Committee may provide conditions of approval to ensure compliance with applicable regulations and standards.<br>● The applicant is informed in writing within 30 calendar days of application submittal if the application is complete or the application is incomplete and additional information, specified in writing, is required before it can be accepted for processing.<br>● A Site Plan Review is issued after the Director makes the following required findings:<br>(A) The project is consistent with the applicable general plan policies and is in conformance with applicable zoning regulations contained in OCC Chapter 16 and the adopted standards.<br>(B) There are adequate infrastructure and public services available to serve the proposed development, including sewerage, water, fire and police protection, storm drainage facilities, and legal access to the lot.<br>(C) The proposed development is on a legally created lot.<br><br>Housing developments permitted under the Additive Zone code are required to follow Objective Design Standards outlined under OCC 16-420I for | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | neighborhood compatibility, building design, massing/articulation, site design and accessory elements such as refuse enclosures. | |
| Page E-46 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). HCD requested information on design review findings. | The City makes the same findings for the Development Design Review process as those required for a Special Use Permit. Those findings are listed earlier in this chapter in Section E.5.<br><br>These ~~standards~~ findings are to ensure conformance with surrounding neighborhoods and increase transparency in the permit review process, thereby minimizing additional costs related to additional work and extended project timelines. Therefore, these standards do not constrain development of housing affordable to lower-income households. | Information added on City's existing requirements. |
| Pages E-54 & E-55 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD ( Attachment 4); and June 22, 2022 meeting with HCD ( Attachment 6 June 28, 2022 Letter to HCD) - Provide discussion on the LCP timeline | **Local Coastal Program**<br>The City will be updating the City's General Plan and Local Coastal Plan (LCP) simultaneously beginning in early 2023. This multi-year work effort is envisioned to take 3 - 4 years. Following City Council approval of the two documents, in accordance with State law the LCP will be submitted to the State of California Coastal Commission for review and approval. The review and approval process is estimated to take 1 1/2 years to complete. Therefore, Fiscal Year 2027-2028 has been specified in the Housing Element for revisions to the City's Local Coastal Implementing Plan (LIP), Chapter 17 which implements the LCP. | This information is being added to clarify the realistic timeline for updating the City's LCP and LIP, Chapter 17 that implements the LCP. |
| Pages F-2 & F-3 | Non-substantial change | Update number of ADU that received building permits through 2021. | **F.2 Accessory Dwelling Unit Potential**<br>In 2018~~, 2019, and 2020,~~to 2021 City planning permit records indicate that an average of 24~~16~~ ADUs received building permits per year.<br>● 2018 - 4~~3~~ ADUs received building permits | Data was added to the discussion on ADU potential to justify the 490 ADUs that had been projected in the October 2021 Final Housing |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); provide discussion of analysis of ADU affordability. | ● 2019 - 14~~3~~ ADUs received building permits<br>● 2020 - 25~~8~~ ADUs received building permits<br>● 2021 – 54 ADUs received building permits<br>●<br>The increase in ADUs permitted in 2020 and 2021 was due to updates in the City's ADU program that became effective in January 2020. The 2020 ADU program simplified the ADU permitting process, revised development standards and waived parking requirements consistent with State law based on ADU location. Because of efforts the City is already making to promote and facilitate ADUs, and additional efforts committed to in the programs in Chapter G, it is assumed that an additional 320~~490~~ ADUs have already been or will be permitted between ~~now~~ June 30, 2021, and October 2029.<br><br>Over the course of a couple weeks in May 2020, the City conducted a survey of ADUs for rent in Oxnard. Six listings for ADUs for rent were found during that point-in-time survey. Address information was only available for three of the listings. Two of those listings were in the northern section of the city in moderate resource areas and one was in the central part of the city in a low resource area. All of the ADUs available for rent were affordable to very low- or low-income one- or two-person households. The average market rate for an ADU surveyed ranged from about $975 per month to up to $1,575 per month. Not all listings included information about size of the units but those that did ranged from 300 to 940 square feet. All listings were either studios or one-bedroom units. In addition, over the past few years, the City has been collecting rental figures | Element. The analysis was based on the results of 2021 and 2022 ADU affordability surveys & 2021 Building permits issued. The 490 ADU projection was reduced following conversation with HCD on a number they would find acceptable based on building permit history prior to the City's ADU code update. With this adjustment, the City will still have sufficient units to meet RHNA in all income categories.<br><br>Projected Affordability is based on the combination of the online survey analysis, the feedback from ADU owners in Oxnard, and the Chapple industry research, and has been evaluated by HCD as acceptable. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | on ADU application materials to document rental affordability. Providing this type of information is voluntary for ADU applicants. To justify the affordability assumptions for ADUs in this Housing Element, a summary of the ADU affordability data collected by the City is provided below.<br><br>In 2021, 90 of the 182 ADU entitlement applications reported rental amounts. Of the 90 applications, 94 percent reported rental rates that were affordable to lower income households. The distribution of responses was as follows:<br>● 18% were affordable to persons of extremely low income;<br>● 22% were affordable to persons of very low income;<br>● 54.5% were affordable to persons of low income;<br>● 4.5% were affordable to persons of moderate income; and<br>● 1% (1 unit) was reported at "market rate" which may be interpreted as above moderate income<br><br>In 2022, 34 of the 40 entitlement applications received through February of 2022 reported rental rates that were 100 percent affordable to lower income households.<br>● 6% were affordable to persons of extremely low income;<br>● 23.5% were affordable to persons of very low income;<br>● 70.5% were affordable to persons of low income;<br>● 0% were moderate income; and<br>● 0% were above moderate income<br>In addition, ADU research conducted by the University of California, Berkeley's (UC Berkeley's) Center for Community Innovation (Chapple et al. 2017) indicates that 40 percent of ADUs are typically rented to family members or friends at either no cost or | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | below-market rental rates. Based on the combination of the online survey analysis, the feedback from ADU owners in Oxnard, and the Chapple industry research, 90 percent the 320 ~~490~~ ADUs projected to be built in Oxnard between 2021 and 2029 are anticipated to be affordable to lower-income households and 10 percent are anticipated to be affordable to moderate-income households.<br>The Oxnard ADU regulations encourage this housing type and allow flexibility in their development. The City has most recently updated their ADU regulations in ~~2020~~ 2019 and will continue to do so to comply with state law (see Program 6 in Chapter G). The City also has a dedicated website providing information and resources related to ADUs. Programs 6, 34~~6~~, 35~~7~~, 36~~8~~, and 424 commit the City to other ongoing and new efforts to promote and facilitate ADUs to support the development of an increased number of ADUs during the 2021-2029 Housing Element update. | |
| Pages F-3 & F-4 | Non-substantial change | Current information | **F.3 Vacant Sites**<br>~~Table F-1 shows that~~ Oxnard has a limited number of vacant never-developed parcels with zoning that currently allows residential development, or with changes to the zoning and/or General Plan land use that would allow residential development at suitable densities. A detailed table of vacant parcels by Assessor's Parcel Number (APN) is shown in Supplement 1. The sites that are addressing the lower-income RHNA allocation are described in more detail in Supplement 1. Table F-1 provides a summary of land available on vacant and non-vacant sites in the City. ~~Sites that were used to address lower-income RHNA allocations in the two prior~~ | Discussion on vacant sites has been updated to reflect adjustments to development status of sites within Supplement 1. For example, the buildings on Site 13 (Gold Coast) were demolished, which revised the site classification from 'non-vacant' to 'vacant.'<br><br>Discussion of the newly adopted Additive Zone also added. |

<table>
<tr><th>Page Number</th><th>Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change</th><th>Updated Information or Input Received</th><th>Description of Change</th><th>Staff Comment</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>~~Housing Elements are subject to Program 30 in Chapter G.~~<br><br>Certain vacant sites ~~will need a~~ have recently received a change to their zoning and/or their General Plan land use designation to address the lower-income allocation via overlays that allow greater density with the provision of 20% lower income units~~(see Program 3 in Chapter G)~~. Several sites are part of existing Specific Plans that have not been completely built out. The City will also rely on non-vacant sites and a discussion of the non-vacant, underutilized sites that are available for meeting the City's lower-income RHNA allocation follows this section. The sites that are in the vacant land inventory can accommodate 1,233~~010~~ lower-income units, 142~~1~~ moderate-income units, and 610 above-moderate income units.</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>Page F-4</td><td>Non-substantial change</td><td>Current Information</td><td>Table F-1. Summary of Vacant and Non-Vacant Sites (Including Specific Plans and Pending Annexations)
<table>
<tr><th>Current Zoning Designation (overlays not denoted)</th><th>Total Acreage Per Zone</th><th>~~Current or Proposed~~ Maximum Density (du/ac)</th><th>Realistic/ Net Unit Capacity</th></tr>
<tr><td>Business Research Park</td><td>27.03</td><td>30</td><td>681~~14~~</td></tr>
<tr><td>Multiple Family Residential</td><td>134.28</td><td>30</td><td>1,239~~7~~</td></tr>
</table></td><td>Table F-1 has been updated to reflect minor revisions to total acreage and Realistic net unit capacity based on current data and changes to development status.</td></tr>
</table>

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | (R-2)<br>Downtown General 57.45 Unlimited 2,968~~2~~<br>Downtown Core 28.47~~3~~ ~~1~~ Unlimited 884~~78~~<br>**TOTAL 504.34 ~~18~~ — 9,514 ~~8,512~~** | |
| Page F-4 | Non-substantial change | Current Information | **F.4 Non-Vacant Sites**<br>To provide adequate sites for the lower-income RHNA categories, additional non-vacant sites have been identified as the most likely locations where additional housing could be built by the private sector. As with the vacant sites, the City has ~~some will need a~~ recently changed ~~to~~ their zoning and/or General Plan land use designations ~~(see Program 3 in Chapter G)~~ to address the lower income allocation. A summary of the sites is shown in Table F-1. The sites that are addressing the lower-income RHNA allocation are described in detail in Supplement 1. ~~Sites that were used to address lower-income RHNA allocation in the prior Housing Element are subject to Program 31 in Chapter G.~~ | Discussion updated to reflect City's rezone of parcels to meet RHNA in October 2021. |
| Pages F.12 and F.13 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4) and discussion with HCD on February 16, 2022. To justify the housing projections for residential development on nonresidential sites (BRP Business and | "Realistic capacity for vacant sites was determined by first multiplying the number of acres by the maximum density for the site or 30 dwelling units per acre for the sites to address the lower-income RHNA. Thirty dwelling units per acre has been used for the sites as the default density to address the lower-income RHNA allocation because those sites were~~ill~~ either rezoned and/or redesignated to that maximum density prior to the 2021–2029 RHNA planning period in October 2021. City Council resolution 15,491 making the updates is included in Supplement 3. The realistic capacity | Section F.6 Realistic Capacity was revised in response to HCD input to include an analysis on realistic capacity and a discussion on parking in the downtown.<br><br>The analysis found that none of the commercial or industrial zoned |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | Research Park, C-2 General Commercial, M-L Industrial Limited, and M-1 Light Manufacturing zoned parcels), HCD asked the City to assess the percentage of nonresidential sites listed in the 2013-2021 (prior) adopted Mid-Cycle Housing Element that were developed with commercial uses rather than lower income/residential land uses. HCD requested that the City use that percentage to inform the realistic development capacity assumption for sites in these zones. | calculation was then reduced by 20 percent as a buffer to account for setbacks, open space, access and/or other requirements for sites."<br><br>"To further support the unit assumptions in the sites inventory for these sites that allow non-residential development, the City has analyzed the past development trends on sites listed in the City's current housing element that allow non-residential development. The City reviewed all of the sites with an All Affordable Housing Opportunity Program (AAHOP) additive designation with a base designation of commercial or industrial in the City's currently adopted Mid-Cycle Housing Element (2013-2021) and compared that with current uses on the site. The details about the sites analyzed are below:<br><br>● 20 of the AAHOP sites were zoned C-2, CM, M-1 or ML (commercial and industrial zones). The sites were made up of 80 parcels<br>● None of the AAHOP commercial or industrial zoned sites have been developed with new commercial or industrial uses<br>● Two of the AAHOP sites have been developed with new 100 percent affordable residential uses<br>● 14 of the 20 AAHOP sites (or some parcels from the sites) were continued in the 2021-2029 Housing Element sites inventory as sites that may be developed by right.<br><br>The City found that none of the commercial or industrial zoned AAHOP sites were developed with new commercial or industrial uses. This analysis did not result in identification of a need to adjust realistic capacity assumptions on this type of site."<br><br>In the Downtown there is no maximum density and all projects with residential | sites in the prior housing element were developed with new commercial or industrial uses. Therefore, the realistic capacity utilized (which reflected HCD's standard of 80% of the potential density) was retained. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | units proposed or approved since the Downtown Code was adopted in 2019 have had densities of over 100 dwelling units per acre; therefore, the maximum number of units at 100 dwelling units per acre were calculated for the realistic/net unit numbers on sites in the Downtown. This assumption also relies on the understanding that parking is not a constraint to development in Downtown, supported by the densities that projects are achieving and the Downtown Parking In-Lieu Fee program that is in place. The Downtown Parking In-Lieu fee programs facilitates designation of parking spaces to serve residential projects in Downtown in city parking garages rather than requiring parking onsite for each project. Multiple projects are listed in Table F-2 that are pending or have been approved/built in the DT-G zone and their characteristics support the realistic capacity assumptions for sites in the Downtown. Because there is no maximum density in the Downtown, the state default density threshold was used to calculate the percent of allowed density achieved on projects in Downtown shown in Table F-2. | |
| Page F-13 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); Update projected ADUs.<br><br>Update remaining RHNA based on construction data through February 2022. Update vacant and nonvacant site capacity based on | **Table F-3. Comparison of Site Capacity to 2021-2029 Regional Housing Needs Assessment**<br><br>**Income Group / Remaining RHNA Table D-3 / Projected Accessory Dwelling Units / Vacant Sites Capacity [Supply] / Non-Vacant Site Capacity [Supply] / Specific Plans [Supply] / Subtotal Remaining RHNA / Pending Annexations (Rural Urban and Tiny Club) / Total Units / Surplus RHNA Addr**<br><br>Extremely Low: 1,835 ~~5~~ / 254 ~~490~~ / 1,233 ~~0410~~ / 1,303 ~~4560~~ / 224 / 0 / 165 / 3,199 ~~3500~~ / +2884 ~~439~~<br>Very Low<br>Low: 1,05 | Table F-3 has been updated to reflect 320 projected ADUs for 2021-2029 and the remaining number of ADUs (283) after subtracting building permits to date in the RHNA cycle.<br><br>Table F-3 has also been updated to reflect current remaining RHNA |

<table>
<tr><th>Page Number</th><th>Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change</th><th>Updated Information or Input Received</th><th>Description of Change</th><th>Staff Comment</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td>updates to site status in Supplement 1.</td><td>
<table>
<tr><td></td><td>8~~7~~~~4~~</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>Mode</td><td>1,5~~2~~1~~3~~~~8~~</td><td>2~~9~~~~0~~</td><td>1~~4~~2~~4~~</td><td>504</td><td>706</td><td>1~~4~~0~~8~~~~7~~</td><td>285</td><td>1,6~~8~~3~~3~~~~6~~</td><td>+1~~4~~5~~9~~~~8~~</td></tr>
<tr><td>Above Mode</td><td>4,0~~3~~0~~9~~~~8~~</td><td>0</td><td>610</td><td>2,273</td><td>625</td><td>5~~2~~2~~9~~~~0~~</td><td>707</td><td>4,2~~8~~5~~1~~~~6~~~~9~~</td><td>+1~~8~~5~~1~~~~7~~</td></tr>
<tr><td>TOTAL</td><td>8,1~~4~~~~5~~~~4~~~~2~~</td><td>2~~8~~3~~4~~~~9~~~~0~~</td><td>1,9~~8~~5~~7~~~~6~~~~1~~</td><td>4,0~~8~~0~~2~~~~3~~~~3~~</td><td>1,555</td><td>6~~6~~2~~7~~~~7~~~~7~~</td><td>1,157</td><td>9,1~~6~~7~~4~~~~2~~~~7~~</td><td></td></tr>
</table>
As shown in Table F-3, after reviewing available sites for residential development, the City has an additional 662~~777~~ moderate- and above-moderate income units to accommodate.
</td><td>as adjusted in Table D-3 after subtracting building permits through February 2022.</td></tr>
<tr><td>Pages F-15 and F-16</td><td>Non-substantial change</td><td>Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); HCD requested that the City clarify availability of sufficient water and wastewater capacity to support new housing units.</td><td>● Adequate Water Supply, Water Delivery, and Water Treatment Facilities. As described in greater detail in the 2030 General Plan, the City has a comprehensive multifaceted Water Management Program that outlines how the City plans to provide an adequate water supply to meet forecast water demands well into the future. The City completed and adopted its 2015 Water Master Plan and Urban Water Management Plan in 2016. The land use assumptions are within the range of the 2030 General Plan and with consideration of water conservation, use demand factors, and agriculture water annexation factors, the City has determined it has sufficient water supplies. The City completed and adopted its 2020 Urban Water Management Plan (UWMP) in 2021.</td><td>Section F.10 Environmental Constraints and Adequate Infrastructure has been updated to include information on water and sewer availability.<br>Based on the data provided in the 2020 Urban Water Management Plan, the City has adequate facilities, services and infrastructure to accommodate the planned residential</td></tr>
</table>

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | The UWMP identified additional water sources to plan for future growth, such as utilizing recycled water for indirect potable reuse. ~~The City is currently in the process of updating the 2015 UWMP. To plan for future growth the City is pursuing water sources and implementing water conservation measures.~~ Oxnard voters approved Measure E in 2020 to fund City improvements including infrastructure improvements that would further assist in conservation efforts. In addition to its internal water management program, the City is working cooperatively with local groundwater managers, such as the Fox Canyon Groundwater Management Agency (FCGMA), United Water Conservation District (UWCD), and Calleguas Municipal Water District (CMWD) ~~(Las Posas)~~ on local groundwater management programs, as well as with the CMWD and the Metropolitan Water District (MWD) on regional imported water supply issues. Together, these programs are intended to provide a high degree of flexibility to provide a reliable long-term water supply under a broad range of known (i.e., projected growth and planned water supply projects) and unknown scenarios (i.e., global climate change). The availability of local groundwater i~~a~~s augmented by existing groundwater management programs (including groundwater recharge through the Freeman Diversion project, the Las Posas Aquifer Storage Project, and the Aquifer Storage and Recovery program), imported state water, and the City's planned water recycling effort through its Groundwater Recovery Enhancement and Treatment (GREAT) and Augmented Municipal and Industrial (M&I) Supplemental Water Programs | growth within the city limits during the time frame of this Housing Element. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | will help to ensure that the City will be able to meet long-term water demands. Relative to water delivery, all Affordable Housing additive zone sites would be considered infill or redevelopment and are within the City's ability to serve. The 2030 General Plan includes policies and implementation measures that address a range of water supply and groundwater resource issues. With implementation of the applicable policies and implementation programs, the 2030 General Plan Project Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) found impacts on water resources and services to be a less-than-significant impact.<br>Based on the data provided in the 2020 Urban Water Management Plan, the City has adequate facilities, services and infrastructure to accommodate the planned residential growth within the city limit during the time frame of this Housing Element. The City has the water capacity to accommodate the projected residential demand.<br><br>● **Adequate Wastewater Collection and Treatment**. The Oxnard Wastewater Treatment Plant (OWTP) has a current capacity of 31.7 million gallons per day (mgd) with average daily flows of approximately 19.0 mgd. Sufficient capacity exists to accommodate wastewater generated by the 2030 General Plan and the full development of the Housing Element sites. Major interceptor and trunk lines also have sufficient capacity to accommodate known future wastewater flows. Localized wastewater conveyance (including sewer lines and lift stations) may require additional wastewater flow capacity ~~need to be increased~~ to accommodate future ~~wastewater~~ | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | ~~flows associated with~~ Affordable Housing additive zone sites. Capacity of local sewers and lift stations will be evaluated on ~~development to be determined on~~a case-by-case basis during technical development review. Deficient sewer infrastructure will be addressed as part of the development project. | |
| Page G-6 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); HCD also requested the Housing Element to include goals to overcome patterns of segregation and foster inclusive communities free from barriers that restrict access to opportunity. | **H-5.9 Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing**<br>Take proactive steps to overcome ~~address~~ longstanding patterns of segregation (including racially or ethnically concentrated areas of poverty and areas of linguistic isolation), discrimination, and disinvestment with a focus on use of Federal funds. Foster inclusive communities free from barriers that restrict access to opportunity. | Goal H-5 in Chapter G has been augmented to include additional language under Policy H-5.9 (page G-6) to specify overcoming patterns of segregation, including Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty (R/ECAP) and areas of linguistic isolation, and fostering inclusive communities free from barriers that restrict access to opportunity. |
| Page G-7 | Non-substantial change | Date June 22, 2022 meeting with HCD (Attachment 6 June 28, 2022 Letter to HCD) - in Table G-1, update number of estimated moderate and upper income rehabilitation conservation units to align | **Table G-1 Housing Unit Objectives by Income Category (Quantified Objectives): 2021–2029**<br><br>**Income Group** \| **2021–2029 RH** \| **Rehabilitation Conservation Estimate [Program No.]** \| **Preservation Estimate [Program No.]** \| **Total Housing Units Constructed, Rehabilitated, or** | This revision increases the estimate to be closer to the number of units anticipated to be rehabilitated by moderate and above moderate income homeowners. The revision does not create a new objective for the |

<table>
<tr><th>Page Number</th><th>Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change</th><th>Updated Information or Input Received</th><th>Description of Change</th><th>Staff Comment</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td>with projected needs discussed in Chapter B.</td><td>
<table>
<tr><th></th><th>NA<br>Table D-1</th><th></th><th></th><th>Preserved</th></tr>
<tr><td>Moderate</td><td>1,538</td><td>~~28~~150 [1, 2]</td><td>0</td><td>~~1,566~~ 1,688</td></tr>
<tr><td>Above Moderate</td><td>4,100</td><td>~~28~~300 [1, 2]</td><td>0</td><td>~~4,128~~ 4,400</td></tr>
<tr><td>TOTAL</td><td>8,549</td><td>~~306~~ 700</td><td>431</td><td>~~9,286~~ 9,680</td></tr>
</table>
</td><td>City, as rehabilitation of moderate and above moderate units would be owner funded, while some funds are available from the City for rehabilitation of lower income units.<br><br>Note: The Table on Page G-7 shows the incorrect total in the last column. This will be updated for the version that is submitted to HCD.</td></tr>
<tr><td>Page G-8</td><td>Substantial Change</td><td>Date June 28, 2022 HCD reviewer discussions with the City's Housing Element consultant, Placeworks, requested the City include a targeted windshield housing condition survey to help inform the City on where rehabilitation</td><td>Program 1: Code Compliance Program<br><br>"Additionally, the City will complete a targeted windshield housing conditions survey during Fiscal Year (FY) 2024- 2025 in several City selected older neighborhoods and neighborhoods with lower median incomes, to evaluate rehabilitation needs. The survey will be conducted by visually assessing exterior of homes such as roofing, windows, and siding conditions and categorizing units as sound, in need of minor repair, moderate repair, substantial rehabilitation or dilapidated. Based upon the survey findings, in FY 2025-2026 the City will identify specific needs and tailor housing rehabilitation measures to fit those needs, such as</td><td>This revision adds an action item to Program 1 that will require substantial staff time to conduct a targeted windshield housing conditions survey, compile results and take measures listed based on survey findings.</td></tr>
</table>

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | efforts should be focused.<br><br>Program 1 (Code Compliance Program) has been updated to include a targeted housing conditions survey. | encourage housing preservation, conservation, acquisition rehabilitation, mitigation of potential costs, and minimizing displacement and relocation impacts on residents. These measures may include, but are not limited to the following:<br>· Reaching out directly to homeowners of housing units in need of repair to promote the Homeowner Repair Program (Program 2).<br>· Streamlining permit review for repairs on housing units identified during the conditions survey.<br>· Seeking non-city funding to offer relocation assistance to low-income tenants or owners displaced during rehabilitation efforts.<br>· Seeking non-city funding to develop a housing rehabilitation program." | |
| Page G-9 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); address HCD's comment on AFFH. | **Program 2: Citywide Homeowner Repair Program**<br>The Homeowner Repair Program supports an anti-displacement strategy. | Added sentence clarifies that the existing Homeowner Repair Program supports an AFFH strategy. |
| Page G-9 and G-10 | Non-substantial change | Update program following City rezoning to meet RHNA in October 2021. Rename program, update timeframe and Program Objective, remove reference to rezoning that has took place | **Program 3: ~~Rezone to Meet RHNA~~ No Net Loss Monitoring**<br><br>**Time Frame: Assess whether sufficient sites remain annually and continue to maintain sufficient sites at all income categories throughout the planning period.~~Time Frame: Rezoning will be completed prior to or concurrent with Housing Element adoption by October 15, 2021.~~**<br><br>Maintain sufficient sites to meet the RHNA throughout the planning period ~~Rezone sites to allow 30 dwelling units per acre (du/ac) and continue to~~ | This update removes a portion of Program 3 that was completed in October 2021 with the City rezone of parcels in Supplement 1 to accommodate the default density of 30 dwelling units/acre. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | in October 2021. | ~~maintain a running sites inventory that meets or exceeds the remaining RHNA lower income allocation need.~~<br><br>~~To address the 2021–2029 RHNA, the City shall amend the General Plan and the Zoning Code, as needed, and as detailed in Chapter F, Achieving the RHNA Allocation, to provide adequate site(s) for at least 2,911 lower-income units and allow 30 dwelling units per acre or greater on certain sites or in certain zones. The City intends to amend the General Plan Land Use map and text, as well as Chapter 16 of the Oxnard City Code (OCC ) and zoning map as part of this program, for the Assessor's Parcel Numbers (APNs) listed in Supplement 1 of this Housing Element. This will include changing General Plan and Zoning density and text as needed to allow for the density of 30 dwelling units per acre. Rezoning will be completed prior to the start of the Housing Element planning period, which is October 15, 2021. (This program replaces Programs 3 and 26 in the 2013-2021 Housing Element.)~~<br><br>Consistent with "no-net-loss" zoning requirements in Government code section 65863, the City will maintain an inventory of potential sites to accommodate housing at all income categories. In the event that the approval of a development project results in the remaining sites' capacity becoming inadequate to accommodate the City's RHNA by income category and there are no replacement sites remaining in the Sites Inventory surplus (Table F-3), the City will initiate the legislative process to rezone enough sites to meet No Net Loss requirements. The determination as to ~~on~~ if a replacement site is needed and required will be based on results of the City's Annual Report which will be | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | submitted to the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) on a yearly basis. The legislative process will be implemented when the City does not have sufficient surplus land capacity to meet the RHNA. | |
| Page G-10 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Findings Letter from HCD (Attachment 4); Update Objective to include a metric and add text to address HCD's comment on AFFH. | **Program 4: Urban Village Program**<br>"Accommodate at least 372 lower income units in Urban Village areas identified in Supplement 1 to increase access to higher opportunity areas, prioritizing construction of affordable units."<br><br>"Development of the Urban Villages affirmatively furthers fair housing by increasing access to housing in moderate and higher resource areas by reducing constraints on development of affordable residential units and expanding where they can be built. Supplement 1 identifies 372 lower income units in three Urban Village designated Specific Plan projects (Teal Club 148 units, Riverpark Specific Plan Amendment 118 units, and Northeast Community/East Village Specific Plan Amendment 106 units). Urban Villages~~should~~ occur in the designated areas but may be proposed in others through a General Plan Amendment, and other associated entitlement permits. The integration of land uses is intended to provide and promote a pedestrian orientation to reduce trips and vehicle miles traveled in order to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Urban Villages are implemented through City Council approval of a specific plan and entitlement permits. Within these areas, as stipulated in the 2030 General Plan Land Use Element a minimum of 15 percent of the UVP housing would be affordable." | This revision provides a metric that aligns with the lower income units accommodated within the proposed development project within Urban Village Housing Element Sites (North Maulhardt, River Park Specific Plan Amendment, and Teal Club) |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Page G-12 | **Substantial change** | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); and June 22, 2022 and June 28, 2022 meetings with HCD ( Attachment 6 June 28, 2022 Letter to HCD)<br><br>- In Program 6, update bullets to bring OCC into compliance with state and federal law, including ADU parking, Employee Housing Act, emergency shelters, residential care facilities, and reasonable accommodations.<br><br>Remove SPR action item that was adopted in October 2021. | **Program 6: Zoning Code Amendments**<br>● " In order to comply with recently adopted state law and address identified constraints to residential development, the City will address the following issues and make needed OCC amendments. Amendments to Chapter 17 (Coastal Zoning) of the code will occur once the City updates its Local Coastal Plan (LCP) which is estimated to occur by the end of Fiscal Year 2027-2028.<br>● The City adopted updates to the Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) ordinance in 2020 to comply with state law and implement this program. With the City's ADU program, the City has successfully permitted ADU's throughout the City. The City will amend the ordinance further to make one change to address current state law. By the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023, the City will update OCC Sections 16-468(D) and 16-622 to recognize current State law that no replacement parking spaces are required if using the garage for an ADU. If additional changes to state law occur during the planning period, the ADU ordinance will be updated to comply with those changes.<br>● Pursuant to the state Employee Housing Act (Health and Safety Code Sections 17021.5, 17021.6, and 17021.8) and Senate Bill 2 (2007), in 2022, the City anticipates beginning to update the Coastal Zoning Chapter 17 of the OCC to address updates called for in this Housing Element in Programs 9 and 14 once the City updates the Local Coastal Plan. Completion of updates to the Local Coastal Plan are expected by the end of Fiscal Year 2027-2028. The City will adhere to the Employee Housing Act in areas outside of the Coastal zone by the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023 as | The recommended additional action items are necessary to bring the OCC into compliance with existing law on ADU parking, Employee Housing Act, emergency shelters, residential care facilities, and reasonable accommodation.<br><br>Site Plan Review was adopted as OCC Section 16-523 et seq. in October 2021. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | those requirements are already in effect."<br><br>● "By the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023, update Chapter 16 of the OCC to streamline the ordinance provisions, clarifying permitting requirements, simplifying the code requirements, and creating a web-based OCC .<br>● By the end of Fiscal Year 2022~~By~~ 2023, amend the Zoning Code to allow supportive housing in compliance with AB 2162. This law requires that supportive housing be allowed without discretionary review in areas zoned for residential use in zones where multifamily and mixed uses are permitted, including in non-residential zones permitting multifamily uses.<br>● By the end of Fiscal Year 2024-2025, amend the OCC Chapter 16, Article 5, Division 18 to limit the standards applying to emergency shelters to only those that comply with state law.<br>● By the~~By~~ end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023, amend the OCC to allow low-barrier navigation centers without discretionary review in compliance with Assembly Bill (AB) 101 in areas zoned for mixed-use and nonresidential zones permitting multifamily uses.<br>● By end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023, pursuant to Assembly Bill 2634, amend the OCC to allow ~~study the allowance of~~ single-room occupancy units in at least one zoning district to facilitate housing options for extremely low income households ~~pursuant to Assembly Bill 2634~~ Solutions suitable to address the needs of extremely low income households include single-room occupancy and/or shared housing, establishing deeper income targeting for subsidies on housing projects, | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | providing housing with supportive services or rent subsidies through vouchers.<br>● To affirmatively promote more inclusive communities, pursuant to AB 686, the City will also review and revise the City's requirements for Residential Care Facilities with seven or more persons by the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023 and permit them as a residential use in zones where multifamily housing are permitted, subject only to those restrictions that apply to other residential dwellings of the same type in the same zone.<br>● By the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023, and as required under the Fair Housing Amendment Act (FHAA), amend OCC Section 16-501.5 (Reasonable Accommodation – Findings) to only include objective considerations in compliance with the Fair Housing Act."<br><br>● "~~By December 2022, amend the OCC to include a Site Plan Review (SPR) process for ministerial review of By Right projects. The Planning Manager or designee will be the reviewing authority for SPRs. The process will include objective review by the Development Advisory Committee (made up of City Staff) for consistency with local, state and federal codes, which will ultimately reduce permit processing time during building permit plan check. The ministerial SPR process will not be subject to discretionary review, hearings, public workshops or public notification requirements.~~" | |
| Page G-15 | | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); update to address HCD's | **Program 10: Inclusionary Housing Program**<br>In 1999, the Inclusionary Housing Program was established to generate affordable housing in proportion with the overall increase in market-rate | The program description has been updated to include AFFH priorities and goals. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | comments on AFFH | residential units. City Council Ordinances 2594, 2980, 2721, 2615, and 2688 require developers with ten~~10~~ or more units to provide ten~~10~~-percent affordable units. Developers of rental projects with 10 or more units are required to provide five~~5~~ percent for very low-income households and 5 percent for low-income households. Pursuant to current ordinance provisions, Developers may request City Council approval at the preliminary stage ~~in advance for payment~~ of entitlement processing (i.e., at the beginning) to secure Council approval to pay the City's Inclusionary Housing in-lieu fees (Resolution 15,330), which are periodically adjusted based upon inflation provisions contained in the ordinance ~~The City conducted a study and subsequently updated the inclusionary housing fee in May 2020~~.<br><br>The City will use the in-lieu fees to produce affordable housing opportunities within areas of the City of Oxnard that are proximate to moderate or higher resources (such as place based conditions proximate to the Oxnard Transit Center, employment hubs, education facilities and medical providers) to support upward housing mobility. The City will also seek to improve the existing living and affordability conditions of racially or ethnically concentrated areas of poverty with high rates of households over burdened by housing cost and with linguistic isolation (such as South Oxnard, Downtown, Five Points Northeast and Colonia). The City will also implement anti displacement strategies to prevent displacement of households in areas improved by new affordable housing.<br><br>By early 2023, the City will update the City's Inclusionary Housing Ordinance | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | ~~the inclusionary housing~~ requirements, which will be codified in Chapter 16 of the OCC to take into consideration many components and factors, including construction trends, opportunities, and effectiveness in securing affordable housing, to name a few.<br><br>In addition, to ensure the Inclusionary Housing Program does not pose a constraint to the development of all housing affordability levels, the City will annually monitor the implementation of this program through the City's Annual Housing Element Workshop (Program 41), evaluate the impacts on the costs and supply of housing, and make necessary revisions to the program(s). | |
| Page G-16 | **Substantial change** | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); update to address HCD's comments on AFFH. Add metric. | **Program 11: Homeownership Assistance Program**<br><br>**Time Frame: Develop and disseminate marketing materials for by June 2023, update on an annual basis; Ongoing**<br><br>Assist a total of four~~3~~ households annually. At least half of the households originating from low resource areas and/or areas designated as racially or ethnically concentrated areas of poverty in Oxnard.<br><br>Continued assistance is provided for moderate and lower-income households to buy single-family units, condominiums, and mobile homes. Two loan opportunities are offered with an aggregate ~~The~~ maximum down payment assistance of ~~is~~ up to $57,000, based on income level and need. A forgivable loan will be up to $30,000, with a ten ~~10~~-year term, non ~~-zero~~interest bearing, deferred ~~, no monthly payments, forgiven at the end of the term, or due~~ and forgivable note. ~~payable if property is sold, transferred, or defaults before the end of the term.~~ A deferred loan of | The program timeline, objective and description have been updated to include AFFH metrics, priorities and goals.<br><br>The metric for this program has been revised to assist 4 households annually. To address AFFH, a metric has also been included to require at least half of the households assisted originate from low resource areas and/or areas designated as R/ECAPs. This is an ongoing program that is subject to |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | up to $27,000 with a thirty year term, three percent interest bearing, and deferred note.<br><br>To support upward housing mobility the City will develop focused discussion questions which will be shared during the City's Annual workshop and will address the needs of low resource areas and areas designated as racially or ethnically concentrated areas of poverty (such as South Oxnard, Downtown, Five Points Northeast and Colonia) to offer them homeownership opportunities. To combat barriers to participation due to linguistic isolation, all programmatic materials will be offered in Spanish. The City will also partner with local community-based organizations that serve residents in these neighborhoods ~~the term or earlier if the property is sold, transferred, or defaults before the end of the term.~~ | available Home, CalHome, BEGIN and inclusionary in-lieu funds. |
| Page G-17 | | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); update to address HCD's comments on AFFH. Add metric. | **Program 12: Mortgage Credit Certificate (MCC)**<br><br>**Responsibility: Housing Department and Ventura County**<br><br>**Time Frame: Develop and disseminate marketing materials by June 2023, update on an annual basis; Ongoing and as first-time homebuyers' applications are pursued**<br><br>Continue working with the Ventura County Consortium to distribute funding and work toward Oxnard residents using at least six Mortgage Credit Certificates per year.<br>Work with the Ventura County Consortium to request that they outreach to at least twenty-four households in the areas designated as low resource and/or RE/CAPs through marketing efforts, so at least half of | The program timeline, objective and description have been updated to include AFFH metrics, priorities and goals.<br><br>A metric has been added for the Ventura County Consortium to outreach to at least twenty-four households, with at least half of applicants from low resource areas and/or areas designated as R/ECAPs. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | applicants are from low resource areas and/or areas designated as racially or ethnically concentrated areas of poverty in Oxnard.<br><br>Oxnard participates with a consortium of cities in the Mortgage Credit Certificate ~~(MCC)~~ program administered by Ventura County. Mortgage Credit Certificates ~~MCCs~~ are available for income-qualified, first-time homebuyers and provide a federal income tax credit up to twenty percent of the annual mortgage interest paid. Since the mortgage payments repay the bonds, no City guarantee is required. Mortgage Credit Certificates ~~MCCs~~ can be used with City homebuyer programs to assist persons to qualify for private mortgage financing.<br><br>To support upward housing mobility **t**he City will outreach to the Ventura County Consortium to develop a focused marketing campaign to households in low resource areas and areas designated as racially or ethnically concentrated areas of poverty to offer them homeownership opportunities. To combat barriers to participation due to linguistic isolation, the City will ask the Ventura County Consortium to ensure that all programmatic materials be offered in Spanish, and the City will ask the Ventura County Consortium to partner with local community-based organizations that serve residents in these neighborhoods. | |
| Page G-18 | Non-substantial change | Date June 22, 2022 and June 28, 2022 meetings with HCD (see Attachment 6 June 28, 2022 Letter to HCD) - In Program 14, | **Program 14: Shelter Development Program**<br>"The City will comply with SB 2 requirements for transitional and supportive housing outside of the Coastal zone by the end of Fiscal Year 2023-24." | This revision is for adherence to an existing law. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | update timeline to comply with SB2 requirements for transitional and supportive housing. | | |
| Page G-21 | Non-substantial change | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); update timeframe, objective and description to address HCD's comments on AFFH. Add metric. | **Program 18: Section 8 Assistance Program**<br><br>**Responsibility: Oxnard Housing Authority**<br><br>**Time Frame: Ongoing. Increase voucher utilization; ~~Seek new vouchers and/or to~~ raise ~~the~~ payment standards; expand landlord outreach. Provide annual training to landlords starting in June 2023.~~standard as needed annually~~**<br><br>Continue to participate in the Section 8 Assistance program. Increase voucher utilization by 95%~~, encourage property owners to register units, and~~ seek to raise the payment standard as needed to align with private rental markets. Expand landlord outreach<br><br>The Section 8 Rental Assistance program provides rental assistance to very low-income families to afford housing in the private rental market. Participants' gross household income may not exceed 50% of the median income for the county or metropolitan area in which they choose to live. The income levels and maximum payment standards are established by the HUD. The program has an income targeting requirement which establishes that at least 75% of new admissions to the program must comprise of applicants whose income does not exceed 30% of the area median income level. The Housing Authority must also monitor the rental market and adjust the local payment standard so that the voucher remains | The program timeline, objective and description have been updated to include AFFH metrics, priorities and goals. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | competitive. The Housing Authority will build on the recommendations as funding allows, focusing on the efforts of increasing voucher utilization and landlord participation in the program.<br><br>The Oxnard Housing Authority will seek to increase voucher utilization by expanding our landlord outreach and engagement effort, including a demonstration that Section 8 participants are valued tenants and landlords are not permitted to discriminate on the basis of a Section 8 voucher participant.<br><br>The goal is to improve landlord and tenant relations and customer service, which in turn will impact the participation rate of property owners in the Section 8 program. The City will apply for new or targeted population vouchers as those opportunities arise.<br><br>~~The Section 8 program subsidizes very low-income households who expend over half their income on rent. Prospective renters secure housing from HUD-registered apartments, and HUD pays the difference between what the tenant can afford and the negotiated payment standard. HUD regulations require that 75 percent of new leases be made to households earning below 35 percent of median family income, provided less than 40 percent of their income is spent on housing. In an inflating rental market, this standard is often exceeded, resulting in denial of a certificate. To protect housing opportunities for very low-income households, the rental payment standard must keep pace with the market. The City regularly seeks to increase Section 8 vouchers from HUD. In 2020, the Housing Authority began an effort known as "Rethink and Renew" to restructure operations. The goal is to~~ | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | ~~improve landlord and tenant relations and customer service, which in turn will impact the participation rate of property owners in the Section 8 program . As a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, all efforts had to be postponed until the City of Oxnard authorizes for the department to proceed with community outreach events. In November of 2020, the Housing Authority submitted a grant request to HUD for technical assistance pertaining to the Rethink and Renew efforts. The application revolves around assistance with asset portfolio repositioning, organizational and staff assessment, and analysis of workforce productivity. All of these tasks are aligned with the goals and objectives of the Rethink and Renew effort. The City continue this type of work through the planning period if funding allows. The City will also provide biannual training to landlords regarding fair housing requirements, including the requirement that they accept vouchers, and encourage them to market available units at their rental properties in high resource areas to voucher holders to increase mobility from low to high resource areas.~~ | |
| Pages G-22 to G-27 | **Substantial Change** | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); update to address HCD's comments on AFFH. Add metrics to each action item.<br><br>Date May 31, 2022 meeting with Barbara Macri Ortiz (see Attachment 9 May 25, 2022 | **Program 19: Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing**<br><br>**Time Frame: Fair housing services are ongoing; Create plan by Fiscal Year 2022-2023 and implement on an ongoing basis. <u>Timeframes for individual actions are included in the action description.</u>**<br><br><u>Quantified objectives for specific actions are included in the action description.</u> ~~Average 320 contacts per year. Reach at least 50 households in areas of linguistic isolation to participate in the planning process or~~ | The program update includes additional Anti-displacement strategies, place-based revitalization strategies, and strategies to address barriers. Many of the actions have also been updated to include metrics for assistance to a specified number of households |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | email) - In Program 19 under Anti-displacement Strategies, add implementation of the City's recently adopted Just Cause and Rent Stabilization ordinances.<br><br>In Program 19, add clarification on the projected date when the Sustainable Transportation Plan (STP) will be completed. | ~~serve the City during the planning period.~~<br><br>"The City will continue to provide fair housing services and will connect with an average 320 contacts per year to access fair housing services."<br><br>Specific actions include:<br><br>● Implement this program to address AFFH affirmatively further fair housing, including targeting community revitalization through place-based programs, enhancing mobility between neighborhoods, and developing strategies to reduce displacement risk in areas of higher concentration of lower-income households and overpayment (e.g. Programs 10, 11, 12, and 29) and facilitating affordable housing in moderate or higher resource ~~high opportunity~~ areas (e.g. Programs 26 and 34~~36~~).<br><br>Anti-displacement Strategies:<br><br>● Annually seek funding to provide targeted rehabilitation efforts in low resource areas and areas designated as Racially or Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty to prioritize anti-displacement efforts in neighborhoods within these areas. The City will provide loans under the Citywide Homeowner Repair Program (Housing Element Program 2) to rehabilitate 6 lower income homes annually, with at least half of loans provided to households in low resource areas and areas designated as Racially or Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty.<br>● Work with Ventura County Department of Health and Housing Rights Center to track fair housing issues and identify patterns in the City, including meeting annually to | and focus on low resource areas, areas of linguistic isolation and R/ECAPs. Action items have also been added that utilize the City's Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP), Green Alley Plan, Parks and Recreation Master Plan, Bicycle and Pedestrian Facility Master Plan and Sustainable Transportation Plan to direct green infra-structure and capital improve-ments in low resource areas.<br><br>Implementation of two ordinances that Council adopted in May 2022 have also been added.<br><br>This revision also clarifies the fiscal year timeframe for this action item in Program 19. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | check on the status of active cases. The City will support Ventura County and Housing Rights center to increase public education and outreach on neighborhoods identified as being areas of linguistic isolation, as well as continuing to assist in the investigation and resolution of complaints of housing discrimination, including, where merited, targeted testing. This increased outreach shall include, beginning in 2024, at least one educational outreach campaign annually in an area of linguistic isolation, targeting a minimum of at least 25 households in such areas with multi-lingual fair housing education resources. The City will use its partnerships with community-based organizations that work with the Oxnard Mixteco community to provide access to information and resources, and will invite those organizations to participate in the City's Annual Housing Element workshop (Program 41).<br>● Continue working with Ventura County groups who promote expanded housing opportunities through various financial assistance initiatives and affordable housing/neighborhood revitalization programs and educates the community about fair-housing and equal housing opportunity, providing housing counseling services and family resource information and referral. Through this partnership, the City will connect with an average of 320 contacts per year. The City will collaborate with these organizations and the Housing Rights Center (which provides materials in seven languages) to disseminate fair housing information in all appropriate languages, and to encourage community participation in | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | workshops, and public hearings, which shall include at least one fair housing outreach and education workshop annually, beginning in 2024, in the areas of linguistic isolation and in Spanish language.<br>● As part of the City's Housing Element Annual Report, continue to annually monitor zoning regulations to ensure compliance with fair housing laws.<br>● Each time a housing project is proposed that may influence a particular group or neighborhood, in particular in areas of linguistic isolation, the City will make efforts to distribute information on the project in Spanish, including partnering with community-based organizations to promote community engagement opportunities, to ensure that the group or neighborhood is made aware of the project and the process and has the opportunity to respond. When housing projects are proposed, including projects which may impact a particular group or neighborhood in a particular area of linguistic isolation, the City shall continue to provide interpretation services at said meetings. Further, the City will continue to ensure that public notice includes text communicating that interpretive services are available should they be needed.<br>● Implement the City of Oxnard's recently adopted and codified Rent Stabilization Ordinance No. 3012 and the Just Cause Eviction Ordinance No. 3013 to increase the certainty and fairness within the residential rental market in the City. Both ordinances are more protective than California Civil Code Section 1946.2.<br><br>Place-based Revitalization Strategies:<br><br>● Continue to promote methods which provide opportunities for residents | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | from neighborhoods of concentrated poverty and areas of linguistic isolation to serve or participate on boards, committees, and other local government bodies. The City's effforts to promote job opportunity and ESL jobs at the City's newly constructed Amazon Distribution Fullfillment Center is an example of a relevant program. The City, on an on-going basis, will track participation by residents of areas of linguistic isolation in public workshops, fair housing education and outreach seminars, and public hearings, and will also collect annual data from the Housing Rights Center on all cases opened from these areas which raise potential fair housing issues.<br>● Utilize the City's Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP) to disseminate community programs to improve climate and resilience citywide with particular attention to disadvantaged community areas as identified in the City's CAAP.<br>● Utilize the results of the tree inventory published as part of the City's Green Alleys Plan (2016), with focus on funding tree canopy installation/improvements in Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty R/ECAP areas during the City's Capital Improvement Program (CIP) and in public areas only. Focus will be on areas of linguistic isolation, and neighborhoods identified as disadvantaged communities by December 2025. If tree canopy is less than in other areas of the City, prioritize actions through the City's CIP.<br>● As part of the City's CIP process, prioritize green infrastructure investment (permeable pavements, infiltration planters, trees, etc.) in areas of concentrated poverty, | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | specifically neighborhoods identified as disadvantaged communities.<br>● The City will review the sufficiency of open space requirements (during Fiscal Year 2025-2026) for new developments, with consideration to state mandates and conservation, and City polices and revise as necessary by June 2026 to ensure all residents have access to healthy outdoor spaces. The analysis will consider if more or less open space is necessary to support housing, density, and options for passive or active open space is consideration to water and conservation.<br>● The City's Parks and Recreational Master Plan will assist the City in developing CIP activities to improve. access to parks and recreational areas, including seeking funding sources to develop and/or improve parks or recreational areas and programs and/or partnerships to access nearby recreational spaces located on sites that are not City-controlled.<br>● Implement the City's Bicycle and Pedestrian Facility Master Plan (2011), with consideration to bicycle and pedestrian facilities in R/ECAP areas.<br>● The City of Oxnard Sustainable Transportation Plan (scheduled to be complete in Fiscal Year 2022-2023) will focus on inclusive community engagement to ensure that the needs of each community, age group, and socioeconomic status are represented. The document will incorporate complete streets design, safe routes to school, vision zero, sidewalk or bike lane improvements and first/last mile planning in tandem with land use opportunities in lower resourced areas including R/ECAPs and areas of linguistic isolation. The Sustainable Transportation Plan shall | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | incorporate the findings and key strategies identified in the City of Oxnard Bicycle and Pedestrian Facility Master Plan in 2011 and the Sidewalk Survey prepared in 2015, including the following strategies that improve pedestrian safety:<br><br>o Consider adopting a Vision Zero policy set of goals for reducing traffic-related fatalities to zero by a certain year. The City would work to improve safety conditions for all road users, particularly vulnerable users like pedestrians and cyclists.<br><br>o Consider adopting a Complete Streets policy to institutionalize practices associated with complete streets.<br><br>o Secure grant, or other funding opportunities and seek to install pedestrian-friendly traffic signals consistent with Section 5.2.2 of the Oxnard Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan, such audible crossing signals, countdown timer signals, pedestrian refuge islands, and pedestrian-oriented speed limits.<br><br>Strategies to Address Barriers to Housing Choice in Higher Opportunity Areas and Housing Mobility:<br><br>● Promote transit-oriented development in Downtown Oxnard through implementation of the Downtown Development Plan and as feasible the City's Sustainability Transportation Plan, and review development standards as part of the City's Annual Housing Element outreach (Program 41) to ensure that | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | City regulations promote, rather than constrain, transit-oriented development.<br>● Use land use, zoning, and development standards to address barriers to housing choices in moderate or higher opportunity areas, such as allowing ADUs and decreasing minimum lot sizes. Starting in January 2023, and as part of the City's Annual Housing Element workshop, review land use, zoning, and development standards to identify regulations that constrain affordable housing development in higher resource areas. The City will initiate this process by amending the OCC to allow single-room occupancy units in at least one zoning district to facilitate housing options for extremely low income households pursuant to Assembly Bill 2634 (Program 6).<br>● As part of the City's Annual Housing Element Workshop, the City will meet with developers to discuss possibilities of multifamily housing development on sites identified in Supplement 1 of the Housing Element. ~~located in~~<br>● Continue to promote affordable housing programs and opportunities in collaboration with the Housing Department and economic development organizations, as well as affordable housing advocates and any ~~interested party – see intereste partysee~~ https://www.oxnard.org/city-department/community-development/oxnard_affordable_housing/. These organizations and interested parties will also be consulted during the City's Annual Housing Element Workshop (Program 41). The City will use its partnerships to ensure that representatives from the Oxnard Mixtec community participate in the | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | Annual Housing Element Workshop. ~~43).~~<br>● Continue to provide Ventura County brochures and Ventura County Department of Health and Human Services information regarding fair housing, tenant rights, rehabilitation grants, rehabilitation loans, first-time homebuyer programs, and Section 8 programs in English and Spanish at the Oxnard customer service counter, Housing Department and City libraries. Continue to provide a link to the City's professional fair housing services provider organization, the Housing Rights Center's website on the City's website. The Housing Right Center provides numerous fair housing resources and brochures on their website, in multiple languages. The City will collaborate with the Housing Rights Center (which provides materials in seven languages) to distribute promotional materials (digital and physical) by December 2024 to ensure residents in areas of linguistic isolation (as identified inFigure B-7) can access fair housing education and City and County program resources. The City will use its partnerships with community-based organizations to ensure the Oxnard Mixteco community has access to information and resources.<br>● Actively recruit residents from neighborhoods of concentrated poverty and areas of linguistic isolation to serve or participate on boards, committees, and other local government bodies. ~~Ensure environmental hazards are not disproportionately concentrated in low-income communities of color.~~<br>~~● Encourage additional multifamily housing in high-performing school areas.~~ | |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | ● ~~Meet with local school districts by February 2022 to identify mechanisms of attracting and retaining high-quality teachers to schools in Oxnard.~~<br>● ~~Use land use, zoning, and development standards to address barriers to housing choices in high-opportunity areas, such as allowing ADUs and decreasing minimum lot sizes.~~<br>● ~~Prioritize green infrastructure investment in areas of concentrated poverty.~~<br>● Ensure non-English-speaking residents ~~applicants~~ have access to programs like rehabilitation grants, rehabilitation loans, first-time homebuyer programs, and Section 8 programs through advertising and outreach, including accommodation for translation services during the application review<br>● ~~Each time a housing project is proposed that may influence a particular group or neighborhood, in particular in areas of linguistic isolation, the City will make efforts to distribute information on the project to ensure that the group or neighborhood is made aware of the project and the process and has the opportunity to respond.~~<br>● ~~Expand access to utilities in Racially/Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty (R/ECAPs).~~<br>● ~~Conduct an assessment of tree canopy in R/ECAP areas and areas of linguistic isolation. If tree canopy is less than in other areas of the City, include actions in the Climate Action Plan the City is currently preparing to increase tree coverage in the identified areas.~~ | |
| Page G-28 | **Substantial Change** | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see | **Program 21:Reasonable Accommodation** | The Reasonable Accommodation findings in OCC |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | Attachment 4); update to address HCD's comments on Reasonable Accommodation . | The City of Oxnard will continue to process requests for reasonable accommodation which are reviewed on a staff level (Chapter 16). OCC Section 16-501.5 (Reasonable Accommodation – Findings) will be updated by the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023 to remove subjective considerations in compliance with the Fair Housing Act. | Section 16-501.5 will be revised to only include objective consideration, in compliance with the Fair Housing Act. This OCC update will be processed at the same time as other code updates listed in Program 6. |
| Page G-28 | Non-substantial Change | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); update to address HCD's comments on SROs.<br><br>Date May 31, 2022 meeting with Barbara Macri Ortiz (see Attachment 9 May 25, 2022 email) - In Program 22, revise text for SRO to be consistent with Program 6. | **Program 22: Special Needs Groups**<br>"~~The City will also explore the feasibility of using its CDBG to provide seed money to assist nonprofit agencies in these efforts.~~ "<br><br>"By end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023, pursuant to Assembly Bill 2634, amend the OCC to ~~study the~~ allow~~ance of~~ single-room occupancy units in at least one zoning district to facilitate housing options for extremely low income households." | Revision is necessary for the City to comply with AB 2634 to allow SROs in at least one zoning district. |
| Pages G-29 & G-30 | | Update program to recognize LAFCO approval of Rio Urban annexation. | **Program 24: Annexation Areas**<br><br>**Time Frame: Annexation of Rio Urbana in Fiscal Year 2021-2022. City Council action in Fiscal Year 2023-2024, with~~; Consider alternative approaches if annexation does not occur by the end of Fiscal Year 2021-2022.~~ Annexation of Teal Club feasible ~~expected~~ by 2024-25; Consider alternative approaches if** | Program has been updated with current information on status of the Rio Urbana site that was recently received LAFCO approval for annexation. This program still includes the Teal |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | **annexation does not occur by end of Fiscal Year ~~2024~~2025-2026.**<br><br>The Housing Element is relying on the Rio Urbana Annexation to satisfy a portion of its RHNA allocation, including 17 lower income units, 3 moderate~~The annexation is currently undergoing the annexation process~~ and 147 above moderate.~~may or may not be approved~~The project proposed at this site has already been approved by the City of Oxnard. Because the project site is within the City's sphere of influence it is required to be built in the City not within the County of Ventura pursuant to the Ventura County Guidelines for Orderly Development. Annexation was approved by the County of Ventura, Local Agency Formation Commission (LAFCO)~~This program is intended to create 167 residential units~~ in December ~~8 three-story buildings, including 17 low-income units and 3 moderate-income units. The annexation and rezone is expected to be completed in early Fall~~ 2021.<br><br>The City is also continuing to process a ~~evaluate the potential~~ development and annexation project, known as the Teal Club Specific Plan site, which encompasses approximately ~~of about~~ 174 acres. If approval of the development project and support for annexation is approved by the City Council, annexation of the Teal Club Specific Plan area will accommodate ~~allow the~~ development of up to 990 housing units in a range of densities and affordability. City action on the Specific Plan project will be made in Fiscal Year 2023-2024. Due to Ventura County LAFCO ~~Local Agency Formation Commission~~ annexation processes, the annexation and service district detachment process takes approximately ~~approximatrely~~ one year. | Club annexation site, along with a requirement to find sites to accommodate 990 RHNA allocations if Teal Club is not annexed during FY 2025-2026. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | Therefore, annexation would occur during Fiscal Year 2024-2025.<br><br>If the ~~Rio Urbana and~~ Teal Club annexation is ~~annexations are~~ not approved, this program will also be used to find alternative housing opportunities ~~land~~ to accommodate 990 ~~rezone or up-zone for the creation of the 1,157~~ units (148 lower income, 282 moderate, 560 above moderate) during Fiscal Year 2025-2026. | |
| Pages G-30 & G-31 | **Substantial Change** | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (see Attachment 4); Update to address AFFH | **Program 26: Extremely Low-Income Households**<br><br>**Time Frame: Beginning in Fiscal Year 2022-2023, as part of the City's Annual Housing Element workshop, meet with developers to Look for opportunities to develop or facilitate extremely low-income units. Provide assistance to support development on a project-by-project basis throughout the planning period and on an annual basis. ~~at least annually~~**<br><br>Comply with AB 2634. to accommodate at least 600 extremely low-income units (which represents 2/3rd of the City's Extremely Low Income RHNA) in areas designated as moderate or higher resource.~~Comply with AB 2634.~~<br><br>To address the housing needs of extremely low-income households, the City will continue to encourage the development of housing suitable for extremely low-income households ~~(i.e., single-room occupancy units, transitional housing, multifamily, etc.)~~, with a special emphasis on construction of these units in moderate or higher ~~high~~ resource areas to support the City's housing element goals . , the City will regularly meet with developers and on an annual basis as part of the City's Annual Housing Element workshop (Program 41) to discuss the possibilities | The program timeline, objective and description have been updated to include AFFH metrics, priorities and goals.<br><br>A metric has been added for at least 600 extremely low-income units in areas designated as moderate or higher resource areas. This number represents ⅔ of the City's extremely low income RHNA. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | of developing housing suitable for extremely low income households on sites located in neighborhoods in the City's moderate or higher resource areas.<br><br>The City commits to supporting developers by~~. Activities include~~ assisting with site identification, available ~~and acquisition~~ local funding, ~~financial resources,~~ assisting to provide streamlined ~~and streamlining~~ entitlements, and implementing ~~providing~~ concessions and incentives. Program 22 also calls for allowing single-room occupancy units in at least one zoning district in the City.~~The City will meet with local nonprofit developers throughout the planning period.~~ | |
| Page G-32 | Non-Substantial Change | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD. Update to address HCD comment on parking for the disabled, such as residential care.<br><br>Date June 22, 2022 meeting with HCD (Attachment 6 June 28, 2022 Letter to HCD) - In Program 27, add a bullet to monitor if the City's guest parking requirement is a governmental constraint to the production | **Program 27: Review Parking Standards**<br><br>● "By end of Fiscal Year 2023-2024, pursuant to the Fair Housing Act, update OCC Section 16-622 to classify parking requirements for the facilities for the elderly – residential care facilities, independent living, memory care, etc. as residential uses rather than health facilities and to update the standards themselves.<br>● By the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023, the City will update OCC Sections 16-468(D) and 16-622 to recognize current State law that no replacement parking spaces are required if using the garage for an Accessory Dwelling Unit."<br><br>● "Study ways to increase transit-oriented development in Downtown.<br>● Monitor existing visitor parking requirements for impacts to affordable housing development applications. As part of the City's | Program 27 has been updated to list a revision to OCC Section 16-622 (Off-street Parking) to move the requirements for parking for the elderly from the Health Services category to the Residential category, and expand the types of residential care facilities to recognize changes in the industry (currently only assisted living and nursing home are listed to encompass the various types of facilities, including |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | of affordable housing. | Annual Housing Element reporting, the City will evaluate the multifamily visitor parking requirements to determine if it is a constraint to production of lower income units and conduct necessary Oxnard City Code modifications as needed. (Multifamily visitor parking is presently one uncovered visitor space per unit for the first 30 units; after the 31st unit, 0.5 uncovered visitor space per unit)."<br><br>"Per Government Code Section 65583(a), b~~B~~y the end of Fiscal Year 2023-2024,..." | residential care facilities, independent living, memory care, etc.<br><br>This OCC update will be processed at the same time as other code updates listed in Program 6. |
| Page G-33 | Non-Substantial Change | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD. Update to address HCD comment on the sale of City-owned sites and address AFFH. | **Program 29: City Owned Sites and Developer Assistance**<br><br>**Time Frame: Beginning in FY 2022/-2023, as part of the City's Annual Housing Element workshop, outreach to the community on uses for surplus land,~~Time Frame:~~ Promote awareness of availability of City-owned sites and assist applicants on an ongoing basis; disseminate information on technical assistance annually.**<br><br>Accommodate 193 units affordable to lower income households on city-owned properties in low resource areas.<br><br>The City owns some sites that could be suitable for affordable housing development. The City is actively selling City properties in compliance with the Surplus Land Act where the first opportunity is offered for affordable housing development to support upward housing mobility and housing choice in higher resource areas.<br><br>Through website promotion of the City's Affordable Housing Ordinances and ~~/~~Programs and collaboration amongst City departments, the City will continue to ensure information and | A metric has been added to accommodate 193 units affordable to lower income households on city-owned properties, which is consistent with the number of units projected on City-owned sites in Supplement 1 of the Housing Element. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | assistance is provided about opportunities to develop affordable housing on City-owned sites in compliance with the Surplus Land Act. Specifically, the City will continue to include information about opportunities for affordable housing on City-owned sites, assist developing projects that include affordable units on City-owned land, and/or for projects with State Density Bonuses, in one place on its website. Contact information for the Housing Department and Planning Division is provided on the website for interested parties to contact for further assistance. The City also disseminates information about this available assistance annually to local affordable housing developers and advocates. Starting in January 2023, as part of the City's Annual Housing Element Workshop (Program 41), the City will outreach to the community to discuss and provide feedback on opportunities for development of affordable housing on City-owned sites. | |
| Page G-34 | Non-substantial Change | Remove Programs that were completed with the City's rezone of parcels in October 2021. | **~~Program 30: Vacant Repeat Sites for Lower-Income RHNA~~** (Remove Program)<br><br>**~~Program 31: Non-Vacant Repeat Sites for Lower-Income RHNA~~** (Remove Program) | This update removes Program 30 & 31 that were completed in October 2021 with the City rezone of vacant and non-vacant parcels in Supplement 1 to accommodate the default density of 30 dwelling units/acre. |
| Pages G-36 & G-37 | Non-substantial Change | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD. Update to address HCD comment on AFFH. | **Program 33 ~~35~~: Allow Housing in the Business Research Park (BRP) Zone**<br><br>Conduct outreach to property owners and community starting in 2023.<br><br>The BRP Overlay zone affirmatively furthers fair housing by increasing | The program objective and description have been updated to include AFFH metrics, priorities and goals. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | housing mobility opportunities and/or housing in higher resource areas by reducing constraints on development of residential units and expanding where they can be built. | |
| Page G-37 | Non-substantial Change | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD; Update to address HCD comment on AFFH and add metric | **Program 34 ~~36~~: Pre-Approved Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs)**<br><br>Support approval and development of ADUs. Utilizing pre-approved ADU plans will reduce overall development costs and streamline approvals. Accommodate at least 320 ADUs to increase housing choices and mobility to higher resource areas.<br><br>In addition to the 2019 update to the ADU ordinance ~~ordinace~~ that simplified the ADU permitting process, revised development standards and waived parking requirements (discussed in Section F.2), to further support ADU development and support affirmatively furthering fair housing through housing mobility and increasing housing choice in higher resource areas, the City will consider participating in the regional effort to evaluate and adopt pre-approved accessory dwelling unit (ADU) plans to streamline the approval process and lower development costs for applicants and develop a pre-fabricated ADU that can be used in the City. As part of the regional program, the City Building Official will evaluate the accessory dwelling unit (ADU) provisions developed by the Ventura County Association of Governments (VCOG~~VOG~~) to determine how and if they can be utilized in the permitting of affordable housing in the City. Provided the VCOG plans are available to the City, the Building Official will review the VCOG pre-approved ADU plans and options for a streamlined building permit review | This revision adds a metric of 320 ADUs, consistent with HCD's projected ADU recommendation. The VCOG plans, when available, would be reviewed by the Building Official to determine if the VCOG plans are viable for the City to use as pre-approved plans. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | process by the Quarter 2 of Fiscal Year 2024- 2025.<br><br>If the City determines this will be a beneficial program for the City, information regarding the REAP ADU program will be posted on the City's Planning Department website and utilized where appropriate ~~for the City~~. | |
| Page G-38 | Non-substantial Change | As a result of ongoing public outreach, clarification was necessary that the City does not presently have any areas that qualify 'high resource areas' under HCD/TCAC definition. | **Program 36~~38~~: ADU Promotion Program**<br><br>"moderate and higher ~~high"~~ | The program language presently emphasizes promoting construction of ADUS in high resource areas to improve mobility from low resource areas. Program language regarding resource areas was revised from 'high' to 'moderate and higher' to reflect that the City does not presently have any high resource areas. However, in the event that an area is reclassified as a high resource area in the future, the selected term does not preclude those areas. |
| Page G-40 | Non-substantial Change | Update to timeframe. | **Program 38~~40~~: Institutional Land Use Housing Opportunity Program**<br><br>**Time Frame: Amend zoning by Fiscal Year ~~2023~~-2024/2025**<br><br>Program elements would be explored over the next three years, Fiscal Year 2024-2025. | Timeframe revised to reflect realistic parameters based on staffing and budget. The Housing Element does not depend on this program for units to meet RHNA. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Page G-41 | Non-substantial Change | Date January 10, 2022 Letter from HCD (Attachment 4). Update to address AFFH. | **Program 41~~43~~: Annual Housing Element Workshop**<br><br>Each year, hold an Annual Workshop ~~a public workshop~~ to update the community on progress towards implementing the Housing Element ahead of submission of the Annual Housing Element Progress Report to HCD. Outreach will include community based organizations with intention to outreach to all segments of the population. Yearly evaluate sufficiency of program and participation and inclusion. | The program description has been updated to include AFFH priorities and goals. |
| Page G-41 | Non-substantial Change | Update to clarify time frame. | **Program 42~~44~~: ADU Construction Cost Assistance and Accelerator Program**<br><br>**Time Frame: Establish program by the end of Fiscal Year 2022-2023** | Minor clarification added to the timeframe. |
| Supple-ment 1 | Non-substantial Change | Current Information. | Supplement 1: Housing Element Sites Inventory - update Zoning and General Plan designation resulting from Rezone of parcels in October 2021; update project development status for sites; update lot splits. | This revision updates the approval status of a development project on the site. |
| Table A | Non-substantial Change | Date July 5, 2022 HCD Site Inventory review Ava Hoffman requested Update to the Housing Element Inventory table to replace 9-digit Assessor Parcel Number (APN) with 10-digit APNs (9-digits + suffix), | Table A: Housing Element Sites Inventory, update Assessor Parcel Number column to 10-digits. | Although the City and County database use the 9-digit APN to locate parcels, this revision is necessary for the Housing Element to sync with HCD's database. |

| Page Number | Substantial Change/Non-Substantial Change | Updated Information or Input Received | Description of Change | Staff Comment |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | consistent with HCD's database | | |
| Various Sections Through-out docu-ment | Non-substantial changes | Clean up typos and minor grammatical changes | Various | Minor clean up will occur |